



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Mon, Aug 22, 2022, at 11:16 AM

To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Suryani,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law

Author(s): Suryani

Corresponding Author: Suryani

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 22-August-2022 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Mon, Aug 22, 2022, at 1:37 PM

Dear Dr. Suryani,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law

Author(s): Suryani

Corresponding Author: Suryani

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 22-August-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-620-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.



[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Sat, Oct 08, 2022, at 9:07 AM

Dear Dr. Suryani,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service .
Please do not reply to this mail.

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

The article titled "Family aw Reforms from the Criminal aw Perspective in Indonesia " is well written with a substantial area to be addressed. However, there are several areas where the paper could be improved to enhance its clarity and effectiveness.

1. Firstly, the paper lacks a clear and concise statement of the research question or hypothesis. While it is mentioned that the study examines family law reforms from the criminal law perspective in Indonesia, the specific research question or objective is not explicitly stated. A clear research question would help readers understand the focus and purpose of the study from the outset.
2. Additionally, the paper would benefit from a more detailed description of the methodology employed in the study. While it is mentioned that a judicial legal methodology and secondary qualitative data were used, there is no explanation of the specific sources of data or the analysis process. Providing more information on the methodology would enhance the transparency and reproducibility of the study.
3. Furthermore, the paper could provide a brief summary of the main findings or conclusions of the research. It mentions that family law matters in Indonesia are handled by religious and district courts, and certain aspects of the law, such as the minimum age for marriage and protection against domestic violence, are not effectively implemented. However, a more concise and direct statement of the key findings would give readers a clearer understanding of the study's contributions.
4. The paper could also benefit from a clearer explanation of the practical implications of the research. While it is mentioned that the study has theoretical and practical implications, no specific examples or recommendations are provided. Including a brief

summary of the practical implications would help readers understand the real -world relevance of the study's findings.

5. Lastly, the paper could be improved by revising the writing style for better clarity and conciseness . Some sentences are overly long and complex , making it challenging for readers to follow the main points. Simplifying the language and sentence structure would enhance the readability of the paper.

Reviewer -B

Decision: Major revisions required

This paper provides an overview of the study's objectives, methodology, and key findings. However, it would benefit from the followings;

1. The literature review should provide an overview of family law reforms in various countries, focusing specifically on Indonesia. It should discuss the general perspective of family law reforms, the reforms in Western countries, and the reforms in Indonesia and Eastern countries.
2. It would benefit from a more critical analysis of the literature . While the review presents information from various sources, it lacks critical evaluation and analysis of the strengths and limitations of the studies cited. Adding a critical perspective would enhance the review's depth and provide a more comprehensive understanding of family law reforms.
3. The paper could benefit from a clearer organization and structure. The subheadings and sections could be more distinct and well-defined. This would help readers navigate the content more easily and understand the main themes and arguments presented.
4. Lastly, the paper could provide more context and explanation for the significance of the discussed family law reforms . It would be helpful to discuss the societal and legal factors that led to these reforms and their potential impact on individuals and society as a whole.
5. It may be helpful to restructure each section into separate paragraphs focusing on a specific aspect, such as findings , recommendations , implications , and limitations . By addressing these areas , the conclusion can provide a more thorough and compelling summary of the study's key points, leaving the reader with a clearer understanding of the significance of the research and its implications for family law reforms in Indonesia.

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcs.com>



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Thu, Nov 10, 2022, at 11:53 AM

To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Suryani,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law

Author(s): Suryani

Corresponding Author: Suryani

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 22-August-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-620-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewer 1

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>The article titled "Family Law Reforms from the Criminal Law Perspective in Indonesia" is well written, with a substantial area to be addressed. However, there are several areas where the paper could be improved to enhance its clarity and effectiveness.</p>	<p>Thanks, dear reviewer.</p>
1	<p>Firstly, the paper lacks a clear and concise statement of the research question or hypothesis. While it is mentioned that the study examines family law reforms from the criminal law perspective in Indonesia, the specific research question or objective is not explicitly stated. A clear research question would help readers understand the focus and purpose of the study from the outset.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self throughout the paper.</p> <p>Please see page 4</p>
2	<p>Additionally, the paper would benefit from a more detailed description of the methodology employed in the study. While it is mentioned that a judicial legal methodology and secondary qualitative data were used, there is no explanation of the specific sources of data or the analysis process. Providing more information on the methodology would enhance the transparency and reproducibility of the study.</p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self.</p> <p>Please see page 6</p>

3	<p>Furthermore, the paper could provide a brief summary of the main findings or conclusions of the research. It mentions that family law matters in Indonesia are handled by religious and district courts, and certain aspects of the law, such as the minimum age for marriage and protection against domestic violence, are not effectively implemented. However, a more concise and direct statement of the key findings would give readers a clearer understanding of the study's contributions.</p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self.</p> <p>Please see pages 17-21</p>
4	<p>The paper could also benefit from a clearer explanation of the practical implications of the research. While it is mentioned that the study has theoretical and practical implications, no specific examples or recommendations are provided. Including a brief summary of the practical implications would help readers understand the real-world relevance of the study's findings.</p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self.</p> <p>Please see pages 17-19</p>
5	<p>Lastly, the paper could be improved by revising the writing style for better clarity and conciseness. Some sentences are overly long and complex, making it challenging for readers to follow the main points. Simplifying the language and sentence structure would enhance the readability of the paper.</p>	<p>Thank you, dear reviewer. Done as suggested by your kind self throughout the paper.</p>

Response to Reviewer 2

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	This paper provides an overview of the study's objectives, methodology, and key findings. However, it would benefit from the followings;	Thankyou respected reviewer.
1	The literature review should provide an overview of family law reforms in various countries, focusing specifically on Indonesia. It should discuss the general perspective of family law reforms, the reforms in Western countries, and the reforms in Indonesia and Eastern countries.	Thankyou, dear review. Now the literature review provides an overview of family law reforms in various countries, focusing specifically on Indonesia. It discusses the general perspective of family law reforms, the reforms in Western countries, and the reforms in Indonesia and Eastern countries. Please see pages 6-11
2	It would benefit from a more critical analysis of the literature. While the review presents information from various sources, it lacks critical evaluation and analysis of the strengths and limitations of the studies cited. Adding a critical perspective would enhance the review's depth and provide a more comprehensive understanding of family law reforms.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self. Please see pages 11-13
3	The paper could benefit from a clearer organization and structure. The subheadings and sections could be more distinct and well-defined. This would help readers navigate the content more easily	Dear reviewer. Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self.

	and understand the main themes and arguments presented.	
4	Lastly, the paper could provide more context and explanation for the significance of the discussed family law reforms. It would be helpful to discuss the societal and legal factors that led to these reforms and their potential impact on individuals and society as a whole.	Dear reviewer. Done as suggested by your kind self. Please see pages 2-3, and 18
5	It may be helpful to restructure each section into separate paragraphs focusing on a specific aspect, such as findings, recommendations, implications, and limitations. By addressing these areas, the conclusion can provide a more thorough and compelling summary of the study's key points, leaving the reader with a clearer understanding of the significance of the research and its implications for family law reforms in Indonesia.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested.



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Sat, Dec 17, 2022, at 12:21 PM

Dear Dr. Suryani,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .
Please do not reply to this mail.



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Thu, Jan 05, 2023, at 9:19 AM

To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Suryani,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law

Author(s): Suryani

Corresponding Author: Suryani

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 22-August-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-620-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewers

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	Here are some more suggestions for the authors to revise their manuscript.	Thank you, respected reviewer.
1	The conclusion could benefit from a deeper analysis of the reforms that have been implemented and their effectiveness. Providing specific examples or case studies to support the argument that the current reforms have been inadequate would be helpful.	Thank you, dear review. We have now added a deeper analysis of the reforms that have been implemented and their effectiveness. Please see pages 18-19
2	The limitations and shortcomings of the study are mentioned, but they could be discussed in more detail. The conclusion should explicitly acknowledge how these limitations may impact the validity or generalizability of the findings. Additionally, suggestions for future research could be more specific and highlight areas that need further exploration.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested. Please see pages 19-21
3	While the conclusion presents recommendations and implications based on the findings, it would be beneficial to acknowledge alternative perspectives or potential challenges to implementing these recommendations. This would help to provide a more balanced view of the situation.	Dear reviewer. Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as per suggestion. Please see page 21



Suryani <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Suryani" <suryani@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

Mon, Feb 20, 2023, at 10:36 AM

Dear Dr. Suryani,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Family Law Reform in Indonesia in the Perspective of Criminal Law

Author(s): Suryani

Corresponding Author: Suryani

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 22-August-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-620-2022

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 18 No. 1, 2023). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.