

Delegitimization of Leadership in Overcoming Difficulties in Online Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic

by Khairiah 2

Submission date: 21-Jun-2022 09:40AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1860498043

File name: 30032022_fix-Delegitimization_of_Leadership.doc (128.5K)

Word count: 6889

Character count: 41187

Delegitimization of Leadership in Overcoming Difficulties in Online Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic

Khairiah

Islamic State University of Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Zulfi Mubaraq

State Islamic University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia

Asmendri

State Institute for Islamic Studies of Batusangkar, Indonesia

Suswati Hendriani

State Institute for Islamic Studies of Batusangkar, Indonesia

Dahniar Th. Musa

Tanjungpura University of Pontianak, Indonesia

Adison Adrianus Sihombing

National Research and Innovation Agency of the Republic of Indonesia

Abstract

The delegitimization of teachers who hold leadership positions in madrasas, where some madrasa teachers can carry out learning, is in line with ethics code for teacher professionalism, though some have lost their roles and professionalism. The general goal is not only to map the forms of difficulties in online learning, but also to analyze the reasons for the delegitimization of teacher. The specific purposes of this study are: (1) Delegitimization of teachers due to online learning, (2) The teacher's response to the pandemic condition, and (3) the implications of delegitimization on the teacher's life. This study used qualitative methods to explore primary and secondary data sources. The research's results show (1) online learning difficulties occurrence as the form of teachers' delegitimization; (2) the occurrence of difficulties in establishing communication patterns, allocation of free time, innovation of activities that have a positive effect; and (3) there is a loss of identity, and teacher commitment in overcoming the difficulties of online learning. This paper concludes that there has

been a delegitimization of teachers in online learning process at the entire time of COVID-19 pandemic. Because of structural position in learning, differences in the level of status, role, and space of the teaching profession, teachers cannot take part, teachers lose their roles as professionals, and teacher's role is replaced by technology.

Keywords: *Deligimation, Leadership, Difficulties, Online Learning, COVID-19 Pandemic*

A. Introduction

Online learning has resulted in the delegitimization of the status and role of teachers, difficulty to teach, difficulty student assignment submission (Saefulmilah & Saway, 2020), difficulty to monitor student learning progress (Taradisa et al., 2020), difficulty in communicating (Emelia & Muntazah, 2021), and difficulty to apply practical strategies (Daar & Nasar, 2021). Milfayetti and Putri (2020) explain that teachers find it difficult to adapt to technology, interact with students, control learning at home, divide time, have limited facilities, feel out of ideas, creativity in teaching, and are stressed out. Therefore, as Supriadi et al. (2020) show, leadership allows for the neutralization of these conditions, with 140 madrasa teachers in Jakarta stating that leadership has a positive effect on teacher innovation abilities.

So far, studies on delegitimization of teacher in online learning process at the entire time of COVID-19 pandemic show that three major factors drive delegitimization of teacher. First, the role of the teacher has been replaced by technology (Jumawan et al., 2020; Prabawa & Rizan, 2015; Simanjuntak et al., 2020). Technology is easier, more complete, faster, and more attractive. Second, the teacher experiences a loss of role and authority as a scientist (Fraoua, 2021). The loss of authority is marked by the lack of respect for both students and teachers, fellow teachers, even with leaders (Fraoua, 2021). Third, delegitimization of teacher is characterized by high expectations for the online learning process that are not balanced by adequate human resources (Waldopo, 2019), with traditional education making teachers the central and dominant actor, whereas e-learning transforms students' position in independence (King & Boyatt, 2015; Sari, 2012).

Different experiences with leadership delegitimization in overcoming online learning difficulties during covid-19 in several countries. In Indonesia, increasing effective risk communication becomes an emergency response to raise awareness and determine appropriate interventions in overcoming online learning difficulties during the COVID-19 pandemic (Chandra & Syakurah, 2020). In the United States the majority of parents there are many structural barriers and are not easily overcome such as; costs, transportation,

professional instructors, resulting in neglect of educational services (Stack Whitney & Whitney, 2020). In Switzerland to develop a strategic thinking framework during the Covid-19 pandemic and prepare to face times of crisis, uncertainty and unproductiveness, proactively encourage dialogue with various stakeholders, create togetherness in feeling, seizing and changing according to the conditions at hand (Linden, 2021). Creating collaborations with South and East Asian communities to combat pandemics and pandemics caused by racism (S. Lee & Rose, 2021) In Russia distance learning and blended learning taking into account the relevance of this type of ⁷⁵ education in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic (Levina et al., 2021). Therefore, the whole world is experiencing difficulties in dealing with ⁴⁶ online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic.

This study is based on an argument that the teacher in a leadership role is viewed as a force capable of overcoming the difficulties of the online learning process and lacks empirical support. There has been delegitimization of teachers in online learning. Delegitimization can be seen in three ways: (1) the role of the teacher has been replaced by technology that is fast, complete, easy, and appealing; (2) teachers have lost their students due to insufficient capacity and capability of teachers, and students eventually leave their teachers; and (3) teachers have lost space for actualizing professional activities, resulting in the loss of additional sources of income. Thus, ⁶ online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic has delegitimized teachers in the online learning process.

B. Theoretical Framework

This study is entitled Delegitimization of Leadership in Overcoming Difficulties in Online ⁷⁸ Learning during COVID-19 Pandemic. This ongoing COVID-19 pandemic has caused various problems, including education problems, especially online learning problems which resulted in the loss of leadership and teacher roles. In the following section, several concepts and categories are examined which include: COVID-19, Delegitimization of Leadership, Online Learning during a Pandemic.

C. Related Research

COVID-19 and Delegitimation of Leadership

COVID-19 has affected various aspects such as demographics, income levels, infrastructure, ³⁹ health, control, enforcement, government response, and cultural change (Stams et al., 2020). ⁷⁷ COVID-19 has had an impact on various fields including education (Pasani et al., 2020; Chen et al., 2020). COVID-19 has caused many closures of educational institutions due to

government policies to effectively deal with increasingly complex crises (Hung et al., 2020; Angeli & Montefusco, 2020; Utomo et al., 2020), including regional closures (Lake, 2020). COVID-19 has also changed people's behavior with proper precautions such as frequent hand washing, wearing masks, keeping a distance, and even quarantining themselves at home to avoid contact with other people (Zhou et al., 2020). These efforts demonstrate that COVID-19 is a threat that exhibits a variety of protective behaviors in order to avoid the danger it faces (Espinola et al., 2016).

Leadership is a person's effort to influence, encourage, guide, direct, and move others so that they want to work passionately toward achieving goals (Khairuddin, 2020). Leadership plays a strategic role in educational institutions such as madrasas, where it is directly related to efforts to improve the quality of madrasa education as teacher assistants (Khairiah, 2020), madrasa managers, organizers, and supervisors of the units they lead (Maufiroh et al., 2021). Leadership as policy makers in madrasas determines the quality of education (Suratiningsih & Subagya, 2021). In addition, leadership is also fully responsible for the learning process (Lifomita & Sholeh, 2021). As a form of responsibility, leadership must be creative and innovative in order for the madrasa to progress to the pinnacle of its goals (Khairuddin, 2020).

Madrasas, as educational institutions, can lead to leadership delegitimization, which manifests as a loss of honor, role, and even legitimacy. It can be seen from the designed policies that cannot be implemented. Delegitimization is driven by three main factors. First, the leadership role is replaced by technology (Jumawan et al., 2020; Prabawa & Rizan, 2015; Simanjuntak et al., 2020). Technology affects the way leaders make decisions, and policy is highly dependent on the technological knowledge that leaders have. Second, leaders and teachers have lost their honor as scientists (Fraoua, 2021). There is no longer any respect for both students and teachers, fellow teachers, and even teachers and leaders (Fraoua, 2021). Third, delegitimization of leadership is characterized by high expectations for the online learning process, but it is not matched by adequate human resources (Waldopo, 2019). These three delegitimizing factors have resulted in a change in the teacher's experience from the central actor as an information provider, task giver, assessor and facilitator, to teachers only as lighters and students as information providers (King & Boyatt, 2015; Sari, 2012).

Online Learning process on COVID-19 Pandemic

COVID-19 pandemic which has become endemic in most countries has transformed the education system from offline to online (Adedoyin & Soykan, 2020). Existing studies show that educational transformation is driven by three main factors. First, COVID-19 has a high level of risk of transmission, where this virus has caused high mortality rates in almost all of the world (Banerjee et al., 2022). This has prompted the government to implement policies to reduce mobility and community activities. This restriction is in the form of a policy to close

several places that are suspected to increase the transmission of COVID-19 massively. Second, face-to-face schools generate crowds that can trigger new clusters of transmission. In this case, crowds can be a factor in the high transmission of COVID-19 massively (Lam et al., 2020; Stange et al., 2021; Kuntardjo & Seborg, 2020). Third, the existence of online schools has been driven by technological developments that have penetrated almost all levels of society, making it possible to carry out online learning (Agaton & Cueto, 2021; Zulherman et al., 2021). However, at the same time, the facts on the ground show various difficulties in conducting online learning. Some of the challenges include internet access that does not reach all regions and economic conditions that make purchasing standardized communication tools to conduct schools online impossible.

Existing studies on online learning have revealed three trends. First, online learning is an alternative to effectively implement education during the pandemic (Hunt & Oyarzun 2020; Lasfeto & Ulfa 2020; Volungevičienė et al. 2020). This effectiveness can be seen in the flexibility of the implementation of learning that can be done anywhere and anytime without being bound by space and time (Rifa'ie, 2020; Veletsianos et al., 2021). This flexibility arises where ever-evolving technology has made everyone connect, share, and create knowledge. This has made online learning more desirable and chosen as a solution to overcome learning that is threatened during the pandemic. Second, the transformation of the education system to online looks at the role of actors involved in its implementation, i.e., students, teachers, and administrators (Purnamasari et al., 2016; Kerr, 2011; Ahsani, 2020; Mor et al., 2014; Paulsen & McCormick, 2020; Lasfeto & Ulfa, 2020; Queiros & de Villiers, 2016; Dziuban et al., 2015; Hew, 2015). In online learning, not only students and teachers are involved in learning, but administrators also play a role in technical matters such as operating and managing the course of online learning. Third, the agency in the implementation of online learning (Luyt, 2013; Zaborova et al., 2017; Lau et al., 2018; Heggart & Yoo, 2018; Paniagua, 2019; Blicek et al., 2019). The existence of integrated agencies such as schools, colleges, and institutions affects the implementation of online learning, where these agencies have a role to design quality online learning both in the process and the output of learning.

⁶⁰ D. Purpose of the study

The purpose of this study is to complete the shortcomings of previous studies on the delegitimization of teachers in overcoming the difficulties of online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic. Teachers lose their role, authority, students, and lose their welfare from their professional activities. Therefore, three questions can be formulated; (1) How does delegitimization of teacher occur in online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic; (2) how is the teacher's response to the COVID-19 pandemic and; (3) What are the implications of delegitimization on the teacher's life. These three questions make it possible to understand

the rationale used as the basis for educational policies at the level of delegitimization of teacher in overcoming ²⁸online learning difficulties during the COVID-19 pandemic.

E. Method

In this study, the researcher used qualitative research design which the research data were obtained through a qualitative method approach process sourced from primary data and secondary data. Primary data came from 50 Madrasah Aliyah (MA) institutions throughout Bengkulu Province, and 976 Madrasah Aliyah (MA) teachers. Primary data includes teacher profiles, motivation, types of difficulties, and solutions taken by teachers for each difficulty they experience. Secondary data consists of literacy and teacher attendance, research and scientific publications and statistics on the results of teacher evaluation and competency tests. Primary and supportive data are used as ⁶⁷the basis for analyzing the relationships of delegitimization of teacher in overcoming online learning difficulties during the COVID-19 pandemic.

This study involved a group of principals, teachers, students, and parents of students as sources of information, both through direct interviews and online interviews (via WhatsApp, phone calls). Teachers were invited to share their experiences with overcoming difficulties in the online learning process. Principal groups, student groups, and parents groups were interviewed about their perceptions of the difficulties of teachers and students in learning online. Through interviews, various types on difficulties in learning online process were identified, and then groups of informants and respondents were identified to evaluate their position and experience as a basis for analyzing research results.

The data analysis took place through three stages of analysis and two technical data analysis, the three stages of analysis include: (1) data; (2) data display; and (3) data verification. The data obtained were analyzed through two analytical methods, i.e., descriptive and content analysis.

F. Results

The online learning process has brought various delegitimization for teachers. Examples include loss of status, role, students, and welfare as a result of reducing the space for the actualization of teacher activities, resulting in the loss of additional sources of income. The following 3 (three) main points can be explained: (1) online learning results in the delegitimization of teachers; (2) teachers find it difficult to respond to pandemic conditions; and (3) implications of delegitimization on teachers' lives.

The Result of Online learning towards delegitimization of teachers

The COVID-19 pandemic has brought various consequences to online learning. At least three forms of delegitimization of teacher can be found during the COVID-19 pandemic: Teacher absentia as a result of working from home, student absence from madrasas resulting in a loss of status, and the role of the teacher, with the loss of teacher professional space as a result of teachers' inability to participate.

First, the form of delegitimization of teacher is marked by the loss of actualization space as a result of restrictions on teacher activities. Online learning not only shifts the learning tradition from face-to-face to online, but it also prevents teachers from attending madrasas, causing them to lose classrooms and actualization rooms. This is as stated by the following statements of five Heads of MA in Bengkulu Province:

"The teacher attendance system is based on roster. 10% of teachers are allowed to attend madrasas, thus making teachers lose space." (Head of MAN 2 Bengkulu City)

"Teachers do not attend madrasas, and lose the space for actualizing professional activities such as face-to-face teaching, remedial, and tutoring in classrooms." Head of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan

"Teachers cannot deliver lesson materials and it is difficult to explain the subject matter, due to the limitations of technological devices." (Head of MA Darussalam, Bengkulu City)

"Forcing various parties to make adjustments, both madrasa management and teachers and students." (Head of MA Mambaul Ulum Bengkulu Tengah)

"Teachers cannot be present in the classroom, it is difficult to convey subject matter, because students do not have standard cellphones, data packages, and do not have internet signals." (The head of MAN Seluma)".

Thus, online learning is a form of delegitimization of teacher which has been shown by the loss of actualization space in taking part in the COVID-19 pandemic. Second, the status and role of teachers are not actualized due to the absence of students at school. This is based on the results of interviews with 5 MA students in Bengkulu province.

"We found it difficult to follow the learning process, because the internet network was cut off, and the lights went out, resulting in us not being able to follow the learning process." (A student of MAN 2 Bengkulu City)

"[We] couldn't meet the teacher, it was difficult to understand the teacher's instructions, we lost communication, there was a poor internet network, errors, and power outages, and these happened even until the class was over." (A student of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan)

"There is no place for discussion, not accompanied by the teacher, can't chat with the teacher, feels very far from the teacher." (A student of MA Darussalam in Bengkulu

City)

"It's difficult to meet the teacher, it's ⁴⁸ difficult to understand the assignments given by the teacher, and we try to searching on google, it turns out that google is more complete, and looks more attractive, we prefer to learn on google." (A student at MA Mambaul Ulum Bengkulu Tengah)

"Communication is cut off, the teacher only gives assignments without a complete explanation." (A student of MAN Seluma).

Thus, online learning has delegitimized teachers, the role of teachers has been replaced by technology, so that teachers lose their role as professionals. Third, teachers lose space for professional activities that became routine before the pandemic. This is based on the interview results from 5 parents of MA students in Bengkulu province.

"Creating a distance between students and teachers, students fully study at home, we don't understand." (Parents of MAN 2 Bengkulu City student)

"Before the pandemic, there were lessons at the teacher's house, but now there is no place for tutoring." (Parents of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan student)

"Children lost their teachers, and lost places to study during the COVID-19 pandemic." (Parents of MA Darussalam student in Bengkulu City)

"There are no study groups, no place for discussion, we don't understand online learning." (Parents of MA Mambaul Ulum Student, Central Bengkulu).

"The child has lost their teacher, has lost a place to study, and I am not able to guide my child." (Parents of MAN Seluma student).

Therefore, online learning has created difficulties for both parents and teachers. Teachers lose the space for professional actualization, resulting in the loss of additional sources of income for teachers (for more details, see the teachers' experience in Table 1 below).

Table 1
Delegitimization of Teacher Occurs due to Online Learning

Participants	Teacher Experience ⁵⁴	Code
Informant 1 Informant 2	The learning process during the COVID-19 pandemic was carried out online, the teacher was not present in class explaining the material in detail and clearly, and it was difficult to monitor the students.	Not attending school
⁵⁷ Informant 3 Informant 4 Informant 5 Informant 6 Informant 7 Informant 9 Informant 10 Informant 11 Informant 12 Informant 13	The material presented was not optimal, because through videos, photos, phone, WA, and written summaries. It was difficult to monitor students. Finally, the teacher left the students, because Google services were more complete and interesting, the teacher had difficulty getting closer to the students, there was neglect of the teacher's orders, lost the actualization space, the teacher's authority is lost, the teacher is replaced by technology, so the teacher loses a place in the students' hearts.	Losing students
Informant 8, Informant 14, Informant 15	⁵³ It is difficult to control students outside of the classroom; teachers lose tutoring rooms, remedial classes, and tutoring group rooms; and additional source of income is eliminated.	Loss of professional activity

Implications of delegitimization on the teacher's life

The delegitimization of the teacher's life has three consequences: (1) a loss of identity and commitment occurs, (2) teacher welfare deteriorates, and (3) psychotrauma or mental health deteriorates. These three things show the delegitimization of teachers' lives in the online learning process during the COVID-19 pandemic. ²⁸

First, there is a loss of identity and commitment. This is as explained by the five Heads of MA in Bengkulu Province.

"Teachers are inconsistent with the lesson schedule that has been set, because they clash with other activities at home." (Head of MAN 2 Bengkulu City)

"Teachers have difficulty to follow the development of technology, causing teachers

to think negatively about online learning." (Head of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan)
"It is difficult to adapt, difficult to create more diverse learning strategies and learning media., resulting in loss of commitment, and loss of motivation." (Head of MA Darussalam Bengkulu City)

"Online learning experiences various problems, such as changes in student attitudes, teachers feel disrespected, filled with negative feelings, and easily offended." (Head of MA Mambaul Ulum Bengkulu Tengah)

"Students are not ready for technological equipment, including teachers who are still clueless, resulting in teachers losing their dignity, prestige, and dignity in front of students." (Head of MAN Seluma)

Thus, the process of learning online brought many problems toward teachers and students, it is shown to lose identity and commitment, so that if left unchecked it can become a threat to the quality of education. Second, the ³¹online learning process during the COVID-19 pandemic has caused various forms of difficulties for teachers. They were not only difficult in learning in class, but also difficult to conduct learning outside the classroom, as mentioned by five Heads of MA in Bengkulu Province.

"There are still technically educated teachers, so teachers lose places for distribution of professional activities, such as tutoring classes, and tutoring rooms outside of class hours." (Head of MAN 2 Bengkulu City)

"There is a gap between teachers and students, where the teacher used to be a source of knowledge, now it has changed to only receiving reports from students, and students are forced to be independent in learning." (Head of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan)

"The online learning process causes concern for teachers, due to completing literature-based assignments, students rely more on Google, rather than virtual classes created by teachers." It causes anxiety for teachers and students, because technological equipment, laptops, and cellphones are not sufficient." (Head of MA Darussalam Bengkulu City)

"Teachers have difficulty adapting to ICT. It is difficult to apply diverse media, students are bored with teachers, their cameras are of during learning, and they are simply left in the virtual room." (Head of MAN Seluma)

Thus, online learning has created limitations for teachers in teaching both during class hours and outside class hours. Third, there is delegitimization in the life of the teacher during the online learning process. This is as explained by five Heads of MA in Bengkulu Province.

"Losing the role of a scientist, because it has been replaced by technology that is more complete, easy, fast, and attractive in appearance. (Head of MAN 2 Bengkulu City)

"Loss of room for actualization, cannot carry out professional activities, because during the pandemic there are no face-to-face classes, tutoring, remedial, and additional tutoring rooms, as well as missing additional sources of income." (Head of MAN Manna Bengkulu Selatan)

"Losing the actualization of the profession, marked by the teacher being no longer positioned as the most important factor in the learning process because the teacher's role has been replaced by technology." (Head of MA Darussalam Bengkulu City)

"Losing reading room, teachers can't find reading materials in the library, previously all reading sources were available in the library, but during the COVID-19 pandemic, you can no longer go to the library." (Head of MA Mambaul Ulum Bengkulu Tengah)

"The online learning process has implications for the mental health of teachers, marked by the attitudes and behavior of teachers, often feeling disturbed by their mood, pressured by the workload during the COVID-19 pandemic, loss of interest in activities, lack of energy, enthusiasm, and lack of motivation." (Head of MAN Seluma").

Thus, there has been a lot of delegitimization among MA teachers in Bengkulu Province. The teacher's experience in delegitimization can be seen in table 3 below.

Table 2
Implications of Delegitimization on Teacher's Life

Participants	Teacher Experience	Code
1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7,Informant 10,	During the COVID-19 pandemic, there was a loss of identity, such as I felt less happy, and less satisfied with the results of my work, felt uncomfortable, irritable, angry with other people's words, sometimes did things differently from my heart, and often put aside personal principles	Loss of identity
	During the COVID-19 pandemic, it is not only difficult to learn in class, but	Deteriorating well-being

Informant 11	also difficult to conduct tutoring, resulting in the loss of welfare and additional sources of income.	
38 [redacted] [redacted] [redacted] [redacted] [redacted] [redacted] [redacted]	During the pandemic, the mood is disturbed and teachers continue to feel depressed, they lose interest in activities, lack energy, are empty, and lack motivation in learning, and feel less enthusiastic during the COVID-19 pandemic.	Psychotraumatisic disorders

G. Discussion

Studies on online learning difficulties reveal that there are three problems for teachers, First, delegitimization of teacher occurs due to the implementation of online learning, resulting in teachers losing their roles, being replaced by technology that is easy, complete, fast, and more interesting. Second, there are loss of students, due to inadequate teacher capacity and capability, less than optimal learning materials, difficulty in implementing fun learning, difficulty getting closer to students, difficulty communicating, and difficulty controlling students, and teachers losing their place in the hearts of students. Third, there is loss of welfare, the teacher loses the actualization space outside of class hours, such as the tutoring room, remedial, tutoring room, as an additional source of income. These three things are evidence of delegitimization for teachers.

The complex problems faced by teachers during the COVID-19 pandemic reflect that the world of education is not only unprepared for emergency situations, it is also not adaptive. The educational needs of the COVID-19 pandemic, as well as the implementation of online learning, cannot be met by madrasahs. Online learning orientation is still taking place in various forms of online formats. At the same time, Madrasah Aliyah do not have the flexibility to adapt to the online learning system. The implementation of the online learning system cannot be followed by a change in the orientation of teacher-centered education. Thus, the emergency situation caused by the COVID-19 pandemic has become a difficult factor for teachers due to the weak ability of teachers in online learning.

The difficulty of teachers in anticipating changes in the learning system during the COVID-19 pandemic is due to the lack of understanding of changes in technology-based learning as a transition to the education system. Technology is perceived as a substitute for teachers, has had an impact on online learning; (1) teachers cannot attend madrasah, lose their roles, students, and lose teaching professional activities; (2) it is difficult for teachers to respond quickly, develop strategies, build communication patterns with students, allocate

spare time into productive activities, they find it difficult to innovate positive activities, and difficult to stimulate open spaces for professional teacher gait; (3) the delegitimization of the teacher's life has implications for the loss of identity, commitment, and psychotrauma or mental health. The three forms of delegitimization bring technological ideology to teachers and students. Teachers who have been considered as the central center of science have turned into independent learning students.

Due to the delegitimization of teachers in online learning, a series of action plans are needed to restore the role of teachers as professionals. The action plan became a momentum for fundamental changes in tradition in learning. At least three action plan approaches can be formulated. First, a change in mindset is needed about the important role of professional teachers, developing the learning process, and professional teachers being a solution in dealing with the vacuum of the learning system in the era of the COVID-19 pandemic. Second, a change in values is needed to be able to accept the historical reality of the need for independent learning. Third, a regulation is needed that supports the transformation in the world of education that allows a new educational paradigm that prioritizes independence to be implemented in the learning process.

H. Conclusion

This study found that there had been delegitimization of teacher in overcoming online learning difficulties during the COVID-19 pandemic. Delegitimization is due to the structural position in the learning process. Teachers lose their roles as knowledgeable scientists who are replaced by technology, lose authority, there is no respect between students and teachers, teachers and teachers, even teachers and leaders, lose their welfare because they are unable to actualize themselves as professional staff, such as missing out on tutoring, remedial, and tutoring rooms outside of class hours as an additional source of income. Differences in the level of status, role, and space of the teaching profession result in teachers not being able to take part as professionals. In other words, the difficulty of overcoming online learning is a determinant of delegitimization of teacher.

The analysis of the delegitimization of teachers as leaders in overcoming the difficulties of online learning has revealed three key findings. First, teachers lose their role as knowledgeable scientists, because they are replaced by technology, Second, teachers lose students, because the capacity and capability of teachers are less than optimal, students prefer Google which is more complete, fast, precise, and more interesting. Third, teachers lose their welfare, due to the loss of space for the actualization of professional activities in classrooms, tutoring rooms, remedial rooms, and tutoring rooms, resulting in the loss of additional sources of income. These three factors demonstrate a new point of view in dealing with the difficulties of online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic; dynamic difficulties are more

subjective, which can see the consequences of teacher delegitimization, and new directions can be found from this research.

This research is limited to the analysis of one area of Bengkulu province in Indonesia, and at the level of the views of informants and respondents. The findings of this study cannot yet be used as a reference to explain the difficulties of learning online process at the entire time of COVID-19 pandemic on a larger scale. This is because informant perceptions, which were used to infer the difficulties of online learning, were unable to provide a comprehensive picture of online learning difficulties caused by delegitimization of teacher during the COVID-19 pandemic. Based on these limitations, additional research demonstrating comparative aspects of regionalism and sourced from more diverse data is required. Thus, more accurate policies can be formulated in the context of handling delegitimization of teacher in overcoming online learning difficulties.

I. References

- Adedoyin, O. B., & Soykan, E. (2020). Covid-19 pandemic and online learning: the challenges and opportunities. In *Interactive Learning Environments*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2020.1813180>
- Agaton, C. B., & Cueto, L. J. (2021). Learning at home: Parents' lived experiences on distance learning during COVID-19 pandemic in the Philippines. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*.
<https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v10i3.21136>
- Angeli, F., & Montefusco, A. (2020). Sensemaking and learning during the Covid-19 pandemic: A complex adaptive systems perspective on policy decision-making. In *World Development*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105106>
- Antonio Maria, G., Vasileios, P., Giacomo Piero, I., Ai Ling Loredana, R., Marco, R., Giulia, G., Stefania, R., Federica, M., & Gregori, A. (2020). Urologic surgery and invasive procedures during coronavirus pandemic: Retrospective comparison of risk infection in a referral Covid hospital and in a free-Covid hospital. *Urologia*.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0391560320927106>
- Aplikasi M-Learning pada Platform Android. (2016). *Jurnal Ilmiah Merpati (Menara Penelitian Akademika Teknologi Informasi)*.
- Banerjee, A., Ghosh, R. krishan, Basak, S., & Dey, A. (2022). COVID-19 Pandemic: Theory, Concepts and Challenges. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74761-9_1
- Blieck, Y., Ooghe, I., Zhu, C., Depryck, K., Struyven, K., Pynoo, B., & Van Laer, H. (2019). Consensus among stakeholders about success factors and indicators for quality of online and blended learning in adult education: a Delphi study. *Studies in Continuing Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2018.1457023>

- 17
Chen, T., Peng, L., Jing, B., Wu, C., Yang, J., & Cong, G. (2020). The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on user experience with online education platforms in China. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*. <https://doi.org/10.3390/SU12187329>
- 22
Daar, G. F., & Nasar, I. (2021). Teachers Challenges in The Learning Process During The Covid-19 Pandemic in Rural Areas | Daar | JINOTEP (Jurnal Inovasi dan Teknologi Pembelajaran): Kajian dan Riset Dalam Teknologi Pembelajaran. *Jurnal Inovasi Dan Teknologi Pembelajaran*.
- 32
Doo, F. X., Kassim, G., Lefton, D. R., Patterson, S., Pham, H., & Belani, P. (2021). Rare presentations of COVID-19 PRES-like leukoencephalopathy and carotid thrombosis. *Clinical Imaging*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clinimag.2020.07.007>
- 15
Dziuban, C., Moskal, P., Thompson, J., Kramer, L., DeCantis, G., & Hermsdorfer, A. (2015). Student satisfaction with online learning: Is it a psychological contract? *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Network*. <https://doi.org/10.24059/olj.v19i2.496>
- 3
Emeilia, Rindana Intan. Muntazah, A. (2021). HAMBATAN KOMUNIKASI DALAM PEMBELAJARAN ONLINE DI MASA PANDEMI COVID-19. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*.
- 1
Fraoua, K. E. (2021). How to Asses Empathy During Online Classes. *Lecture Notes in Computer Science (Including Subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics)*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-77889-7_30
- 25
Heggart, K. R., & Yoo, J. (2018). Getting the most from google classroom: A pedagogical framework for tertiary educators. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*. <https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2018v43n3.9>
- 40
Hunt, B. D., & Oyarzun, B. (2020). Online Learning Perspectives of Native American Students. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0047239519867921>
- 23
Jumawan, J., Hadita, H., & Khalida, R. (2020). Peranan Teknologi Dan Informasi Dalam Kepemimpinan Di Karang Taruna Kelurahan Harapan Jaya. *Jurnal Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat UIB*. <https://doi.org/10.31599/jabdimas.v3i1.54>
- 18
Khairiah. (2020). Quality Management and Job Satisfaction Among Academic Staffs of Islamic University in Indonesia. *Proceedings of the 1st Raden Intan International Conference on Muslim Societies and Social Sciences (RIICMuSSS), 492(RIICMuSSS 2019)*, 158–162.
- 26
Khairuddin. (2020). Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah di Tengah Pandemi COPID-19. *Jurnal Pendidikan "EDUKASI,"8(2)*, 171–183.
- 6
King, E., & Boyatt, R. (2015). Exploring factors that influence adoption of e-learning within higher education. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 46(6), 1272–1280. <https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.12195>

- 1 Kuntardjo, N., & Seborg, P. H. (2020). Pola Interaksi Dan Kepatuhan Protokol Kesehatan Oleh Pedagang Di Pasar X Kota Semarang: Studi Kualitatif Eksploratif. *VITASPHERE*. <https://doi.org/10.24167/vit.v1i1.2974>
- 44 Lake, M. A. (2020). What we know so far: COVID-19 current clinical knowledge and research. In *Clinical medicine (London, England)*. <https://doi.org/10.7861/clinmed.2019-coron>
- 1 Lam, H. Y., Lam, T. S., Wong, C. H., Lam, W. H., Mei, E. L. C., Kuen, Y. L. C., Wai, W. L. T., Hin, B. H. C., Wong, K. H., & Chuang, S. K. (2020). A superspreading event involving a cluster of 14 coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) infections from a family gathering in Hong Kong Special Administrative Region SAR (China). *Western Pacific Surveillance and Response Journal: WPSAR*. <https://doi.org/10.5365/wpsar.2020.11.1.012>
- 5 Lasfeto, D. B., & Ulfa, S. (2020). The relationship between self-directed learning and students' social interaction in the online learning environment. *Journal of E-Learning and Knowledge Society*. <https://doi.org/10.20368/1971-8829/1135078>
- 42 Lau, A. C., Dancy, M. H., Henderson, C., & Rundquist, A. (2018). Describing and facilitating productive teaching talk in a faculty online learning community. *Physics Education Research Conference Proceedings*. <https://doi.org/10.1119/1.49rc.2018.pr.lau>
- 73 Lifornita, V., & Sholeh, M. (2021). Penerapan Kepemimpinan Visioner Kepala Sekolah Pada Pendidikan Dasar Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Inspirasi Manajemen Pendidikan*.
- 11 Marzuan, & Herlina, L. (2021). Profesionalisme guru dalam mentransformasi pendidikan yang bermutu melalui Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Internal (SPMI) pada masa pandemi covid-19: studi kasus di SMP Negeri 13 Oku. *Prosiding Seminar Pendidikan Program Pascasarjana Universitas Palembang 1-16 Januari 2021*.
- 3 Maufiroh, Y., Afifulloh, M., & Safi'i, I. (2021). VICRATINA: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Volume 6 Nomor 4 Tahun 2021 e-ISSN: 2087 – 0678X. *VICRATINA: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(3), 53–61.
- 10 Milfayetty, S., & Putri, U. N. (2020). MEMBERI PENGUATAN PADA GURU MENERAPKAN MINDFUL BREATHING DALAM MENGHADAPI PANDEMI COVID 19 DI SD INKLUSI JALAN SEI PETANI NO 19 MEDAN. *Jurnal Vokasi - Politeknik Negeri Lhokseumawe*. <https://doi.org/10.30811/vokasi.v4i2.2002>
- 34 Nabi, G., Siddique, R., & Khan, S. (2020). Detecting viral outbreaks in future using enhanced environmental surveillance. In *Environmental Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.109731>
- 51 Paniagua, F. G. (2019). Quality assurance in online education: a development process to

- design high-quality courses. *Lecture Notes in Computer Science (Including Subseries Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence and Lecture Notes in Bioinformatics)*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-21905-5_14
- 14 Pasani, C. F., Amelia, R., & Hassanhassan, Z. (2020). Covid-19 impact in Indonesia's education sector: Challenges and strategy. *Journal of Advanced Research in Dynamical and Control Systems*. <https://doi.org/10.5373/JARDCS/V12SP7/20202281>
- 9 Queiros, D. R., & (Ruth) de Villiers, M. R. (2016). Online learning in a South African Higher Education Institution: Determining the right connections for the student. *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning*. <https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v17i5.2552>
- Rifa'ie, M. (2020a). COVID-19 PANDEMIC: THE FLEXIBILITY OF ONLINE LEARNING AT SMK NEGERI 5 YOGYAKARTA. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan*. <https://doi.org/10.24832/jpnk.v5i2.1605>
- 41 Rifa'ie, M. (2020b). Fleksibilitas Pembelajaran Daring Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Flexibility of Online Learning During Covid-19 Pandemic. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan*.
- 33 Saefulmilah, R. M. I., & Saway, M. H. M. (2020). HAMBATAN-HAMBATAN PADA PELAKSANAAN PEMBELAJARAN DARING DI SMA RIYADHUL JANNAH JALANCAGAK SUBANG. *Nusantara : Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial*.
- 16 Shams, S. A., Haleem, A., & Javaid, M. (2020). Analyzing COVID-19 pandemic for unequal distribution of tests, identified cases, deaths, and fatality rates in the top 18 countries. *Diabetes and Metabolic Syndrome: Clinical Research and Reviews*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsx.2020.06.051>
- 61 Shanshal, M. (2020). COVID-19 related anagen effluvium. *Journal of Dermatological Treatment*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546634.2020.1792400>
- Shereen, M. A., Khan, S., Kazmi, A., Bashir, N., & Siddique, R. (2020). COVID-19 infection: Origin, transmission, and characteristics of human coronaviruses. In *Journal of Advanced Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jare.2020.03.005>
- 58 Simanjuntak, P., Purnomo, C. C., Filipus, C., & Haryady. (2020). Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Transformasional, Teknologi Digital dan Keragaman Budaya Kerja Terhadap Efektivitas Tim Pelaksana Konstruksi. *Laporan Akhir Penelitian*.
- 1 Stange, M., Marii, A., Roloff, T., Seth-Smith, H. M. B., Schweitzer, M., Brunner, M., Leuzinger, K., SÅgaard, K. K., Gensch, A., Tschudin-Sutter, S., Fuchs, S., Bielicki, J., Pargger, H., Siegemund, M., Nickel, C. H., Bingisser, R., Osthoff, M., Bassetti, S., Schneider-Sliwai, R., ... Egli, A. (2021). SARS-CoV-2 outbreak in a tri-national urban area is dominated by a B.1 lineage variant linked to a mass gathering event. *PLoS Pathogens*. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1009374>

- 4 Supriadi, O., Musthan, Z., Sa'odah, Nurjehan, R., Haryanti, Y. D., Rafid Marwal, M., Purwanto, A., Mufid, A., Yulianto, R. A., Farhan, M., Fitri, A. A., Fahlevi, M., & Sumartiningsih, S. (2020). Did transformational, transactional leadership style and organizational learning influence innovation capabilities of school teachers during covid-19 pandemic? *Systematic Reviews in Pharmacy*. <https://doi.org/10.31838/srp.2020.9.47>
- 45 Suratiningsih, & Subagya, S. (2021). Peran Kepala Madrasah Ibtidaiyah al-Huda Sleman Yogyakarta Dimasa Pandemi COVID 19. *Al-Ikhtibar: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.32505/ikhtibar.v8i1.622>
- 3 Taradisa, N., Jarmita, N., & Emalfida, E. (2020). KENDALA YANG DIHADAPI GURU MENGAJAR DARINGPADA MASA PANDEMI COVID-19 DI MIN 5 BANDA ACEH. *Jurnal Keilmuan Dan Kependidikan Dasar*.
- 30 Utomo, M. N. Y., Sudaryanto, M., & Saddhono, K. (2020). Tools and Strategy for Distance Learning to Respond COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia. *Ingenierie Des Systemes d'Information*. <https://doi.org/10.18280/isi.250314>
- 35 Veletsianos, G., Kimmons, R., Larsen, R., & Rogers, J. (2021). Temporal flexibility, gender, and online learning completion. *Distance Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01587919.2020.1869523>
- 21 Volungevičienė, A., Teresevičienė, M., & Ehlers, U. D. (2020). When is open and online learning relevant for curriculum change in higher education? Digital and network society perspective. *Electronic Journal of E-Learning*. <https://doi.org/10.34190/EJEL.20.18.1.007>
- 47 Waldopo, W. (2019). PENGEMBANGAN KUALITAS SDM (GURU) DI MADRASAH. *Jurnal Teknodik*. <https://doi.org/10.32550/teknodik.v0i0.551>
- 2 Wang, F. S., & Zhang, C. (2020). What to do next to control the 2019-nCoV epidemic? *The Lancet*, 395(10222), 391–393. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(20\)30300-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30300-7)
- Wujtewicz, M., Jęlczyk-Sommer, A., Aszkielowicz, A., Zdanowski, S., Piwowarczyk, S., & Owczuk, R. (2020). COVID-19 - what should anaesthesiologists and intensivists know about it? *Anaesthesiology Intensive Therapy*. <https://doi.org/10.5114/ait.2020.93756>
- 24 Yin, F., Lv, J., Zhang, X., Xia, X., & Wu, J. (2020). COVID-19 information propagation dynamics in the Chinese Sina-microblog. *Mathematical Biosciences and Engineering*. <https://doi.org/10.3934/mbe.2020146>
- 37 Zaborova, E. N., Glazkova, I. G., & Markova, T. L. (2017). Distance learning: Students' perspective. *Sotsiologicheskie Issledovaniya*.
- 2 Zhou, W., Wang, A., Xia, F., Xiao, Y., & Tang, S. (2020). Effects of media reporting on mitigating spread of COVID-19 in the early phase of the outbreak. *Mathematical*

¹³ *Biosciences and Engineering*, 17(3), 2693–2707. <https://doi.org/10.3934/mbe.2020147>
Zulherman, Nuryana, Z., Pangarso, A., & Zain, F. M. (2021). Factor of zoom cloud meetings: Technology adoption in the pandemic of COVID-19. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v10i3.21726>

About the authors

Khairiah³¹ is a lecturer at the Department of Islamic Education Management, Faculty of Postgraduate, at Islamic State University of Fatmawati Sukarno, Bengkulu. Currently, she is serving as the Head of Internal Control Unit. Her research interests include education management, Islamic education, multicultural education, and internal control system.

Zulfi Mubaraq¹⁹ is a lecturer of Islamic Studies and Sociology of Religion at Islamic State University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang (UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim), East Java, Indonesia. He earns his master's degree at the Faculty of Islamic Society Sociology, Muhammadiyah University, Malang in 2002.

Asmendri³¹ is a lecturer at the Department of Islamic Education Management, Faculty of Postgraduate, at IAIN Batusangkar, West Sumatra, Indonesia. He is also a National Reviewer of Research, Publication and Community Service (LITAPDIMAS), Indonesia Ministry of Religion Affairs. His research interests include educational management, educational leadership and policy study, and Islamic education.

Suswati Hendriani is a lecturer at State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Batusangkar, West Sumatera, Indonesia. Currently, she is serving as the Director of Graduate Program. Her research interests are based on her teaching are EFL teaching and learning, English language learning strategy, learners' motivation, belief, and perception, ICT use, teacher's psychology and workloads, gender studies, and educational management.

Dahniar is a lecturer in the Social Anthropology Study Program, Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,

Tanjungpura **University**, Pontianak. Her research interests include Gender and Sexuality, Multicultural, Religious Intolerance, and Ethnomedicine.

Adison Adrianus Sihombing is a researcher at the **Center for Research and Development of Religious Literature and Heritage, Agency for Research and Development and Training Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia**. His research interests include education management, religion education, and religious culture education.

Delegitimization of Leadership in Overcoming Difficulties in Online Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic

ORIGINALITY REPORT

15%

SIMILARITY INDEX

21%

INTERNET SOURCES

25%

PUBLICATIONS

20%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	www.jbasic.org Internet Source	1%
2	journal.unnes.ac.id Internet Source	1%
3	Submitted to Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia Student Paper	1%
4	e-journal.stie-kusumanegara.ac.id Internet Source	1%
5	download.atlantis-press.com Internet Source	1%
6	jsser.org Internet Source	1%
7	Liang G. Qu, Marlon Perera, Nathan Lawrentschuk, Rainy Umbas, Laurence Klotz. "Scoping review: hotspots for COVID-19 urological research: what is being published and from where?", World Journal of Urology, 2020	1%

8	Submitted to Vrije Universiteit Brussel Student Paper	1 %
9	Submitted to University of Witwatersrand Student Paper	1 %
10	jurnal.umpwr.ac.id Internet Source	1 %
11	zenodo.org Internet Source	1 %
12	Kenneth Ian Talosig Batac, Jonnedel Azucena Baquiran, Casper Boongaling Agaton. "Qualitative Content Analysis of Teachers' Perceptions and Experiences in Using Blended Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic", International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research, 2021 Publication	1 %
13	Submitted to Sydney Institute of Technology and Commerce Student Paper	1 %
14	files.eric.ed.gov Internet Source	<1 %
15	msocialsciences.com Internet Source	<1 %
16	peerj.com Internet Source	<1 %

17	Submitted to Kaplan International Colleges Student Paper	<1 %
18	ejournal.iainbengkulu.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
19	www.bioleagues.com Internet Source	<1 %
20	ouci.dntb.gov.ua Internet Source	<1 %
21	Teresa Oliveira Ramos, Carla Morais, Cristina Ribeiro. "chapter 4 Evaluating the Quality of an Online Course in Information Literacy Applied to Engineering Students", IGI Global, 2021 Publication	<1 %
22	Submitted to University of South Africa Student Paper	<1 %
23	ejurnal.ubharajaya.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
24	giapjournals.com Internet Source	<1 %
25	journal.lppmunindra.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
26	jbasic.org Internet Source	<1 %
	raiith.iith.ac.in	

27	Internet Source	<1 %
28	www.frontiersin.org Internet Source	<1 %
29	journal.staihubbulwathan.id Internet Source	<1 %
30	lingua.soloclcs.org Internet Source	<1 %
31	repository.uinsu.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
32	Submitted to The University of Manchester Student Paper	<1 %
33	ejournal.undiksha.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
34	www.rsdjournal.org Internet Source	<1 %
35	Submitted to Intercollege Student Paper	<1 %
36	www.revistacomunicar.com Internet Source	<1 %
37	bioresources.cnr.ncsu.edu Internet Source	<1 %
38	digilib.uin-suka.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %

39	www.apgads.lu.lv Internet Source	<1 %
40	Submitted to Sunway Education Group Student Paper	<1 %
41	journal.ikipsiliwangi.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
42	www.compadre.org Internet Source	<1 %
43	Submitted to University College London Student Paper	<1 %
44	Debojyoti Dhar, Abhishek Mohanty. "Gut microbiota and Covid-19- possible link and implications", Virus Research, 2020 Publication	<1 %
45	journal.iainlangsa.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
46	Francisca Francisca, Jovanka Oktavia Venneza Zahra, Sri Hesty Anggraeni, Ani Nur Aeni. "Pengembangan E-book BUDIMAS "Buku Digital Agama Islam" untuk Pembelajaran PAI pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar", Jurnal Basicedu, 2022 Publication	<1 %
47	www.edukatif.org Internet Source	<1 %

48 Sahari Sahari, Ishak Talibo, Nurhayati
Nurhayati, Rosdalina Bukido. "Adjustment of
Online Learning: The Problem Experienced by
Parents, Teachers, and Students during the
Covid-19 Pandemic", AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal
Pendidikan, 2022
Publication

49 Submitted to Universitas Muhammadiyah
Yogyakarta
Student Paper

50 proceeding.researchsynergypress.com
Internet Source

51 Wendy Chin, James Braman, Hanks Melissa,
Paulette Comet. "chapter 8 Working Towards
a Data Science Associates Degree Program",
IGI Global, 2022
Publication

52 edulearn.intelektual.org
Internet Source

53 link.springer.com
Internet Source

54 ojs.unm.ac.id
Internet Source

55 www.sciencegate.app
Internet Source

nopren.ucsf.edu

56

Internet Source

<1 %

57

repositori.uin-alauddin.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

58

repository.uki.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

59

Michael Chandra, Rizma Adlia Syakurah. "Potential use of personal protection online search during COVID-19 pandemic for predicting and monitoring public response", International Journal of Public Health Science (IJPHS), 2020

Publication

<1 %

60

Submitted to Curtin University of Technology

Student Paper

<1 %

61

Submitted to Kaplan University

Student Paper

<1 %

62

Supriyanto, Achmad Sani. "Role of Procedural Justice, Organizational Commitment and Job Satisfaction on job Performance: The Mediating Effects of Organizational Citizenship Behavior", International Journal of Business and Management, 2013.

Publication

<1 %

63

repository.untad.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

64	Submitted to The University of the South Pacific Student Paper	<1 %
65	Journal.walisongo.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
66	ejournal.uin-suka.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
67	hrmars.com Internet Source	<1 %
68	kjie.ppj.unp.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
69	ojs.iainbatusangkar.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
70	proceedings.eden-online.org Internet Source	<1 %
71	www.jnmp.ru Internet Source	<1 %
72	www.nornesk.no Internet Source	<1 %
73	Jyx.jyu.fi Internet Source	<1 %
74	covid19biblio.com Internet Source	<1 %
75	dspace.tnpu.edu.ua	

Internet Source

<1 %

76

obsesi.or.id

Internet Source

<1 %

77

repositorium.sdum.uminho.pt

Internet Source

<1 %

78

usaidlearninglab.org

Internet Source

<1 %

79

www.pegegog.net

Internet Source

<1 %

80

connect.academics.education

Internet Source

<1 %

81

eppi.ioe.ac.uk

Internet Source

<1 %

82

era.ed.ac.uk

Internet Source

<1 %

83

fud.edu.ng

Internet Source

<1 %

84

ijstr.org

Internet Source

<1 %

85

jurnaldikbud.kemdikbud.go.id

Internet Source

<1 %

86

www.learntechlib.org

Internet Source

<1 %

Exclude quotes Off

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography Off