

Wali Pitu in Bali: Inventing New Halal Tourism Destinations in Indonesia

Slightly improve the title of the paper in order to be more suitable with the scope and aims of the Journal; our suggestion is:

Wali Pitu, Bali Province as Tourism Innovation for the Indonesian Halal Tourism Destinations

Khairuddin – full name of the author
Institut Agama Islam Negeri Bengkulu, Indonesia.
Email: andiasrifan35@gmail.com

Abstract

The iconic Bali as a Hindu City currently has a double image as a “Wali City” because Wali Pitu tombs were found which differ from those of Wali Songo. Wali Pitu is unique because of its existence at the heart of Hindu civilization in Bali and through a unique process from the cult of Wali Songo. As a new site, Wali Pitu is a new prospect for halal tourism, where several important aspects can invite many pilgrims. Wali Pitu is considered a new halal tourism opportunity to build an image of Muslim holiness amid the hegemony of Hindu society in Indonesia, which serves as the creation of modern religious moderation.

Keywords: *Kata kunci:* Wali Pitu, Balinese Muslims, halal tourism, wali city, religious moderation.

JEL Classification: JEL Code1, JEL Code2,, JEL Code6.

Use this site to choose JEL: <https://www.aeaweb.org/jel/guide/jel.php>

Introduction

- Rewrite the introduction section because is to length; broken in 2 parts:
 - o **Introduction** in which try to show to your readers why this research topic is worth reading about and why your paper warrants Editor attention; This introduction section should to serves multiple purposes. It introduces your topic and aims, and gives an overview of the paper as a whole.
 - o **Research background** in which try to use different statements of Authors in the Literature background

Bali is the most popular city in the world, known as the most popular international tourist destination city (Adhika, 2021; Mastika, 2020; Pamungkas, 2020). Its natural and cultural wealth invites many tourists from all over the world to travel to Bali (Dunbar-Hall, 2001; McKean, 2011; Picard, 2008). The natural and cultural wealth that Bali has only makes it a “Hindu” city (Dibia, 1985; Picard, 2011a), and Bali is better known as a Hindu city than an Islamic city (Howe, 2005; Picard, 2011c). This preference is justified because most Bali’s population is Hindu (83.5% or around 3.3 million people), while Islam is a minority religion (13.3% only around 520,000 people) (Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali, 2018). Based on Ambariy’s information, the existence of Muslims in Bali has existed since the founding of the Hindu kingdom in Gélégél in 1390 and the Muslim community there was marked by the establishment of a Gelgel Mosque. It is not known exactly when the Gélégél Mosque was founded as a sign of the revival of the Islamic community in Gélégél. However, based on the identification of the pulpit of the Gélégél Mosque, which was made in July 1863 (1280 H) (Ambariy, 1985). Currently, the Muslim community is spread throughout Bali mostly in Denpasar, Badung and Jembrana.

This **research paper** discusses Bali as a halal tourist destination, which is contradictory as a “City of Guardians” amid the brand of Bali as a Hindu City in Indonesia. This article is strongly based on the findings of “Wali Pitu” (seven sainthood) on the island of Bali, in particular that it has not been widely promoted as a halal tourist destination by the local government. However, the surrounding community and local tourists have performed routine rituals of pilgrimage to the seven tombs, and their cult has been widely spread by word of mouth. This article also describes the findings of these saints and their cult as ‘sainthood’ (Chambert-Loir, 2002; Stauth & Schielke, 2008) who are sacred and invite local worshipers and tourists to make pilgrimages. In this process, Bali’s branding was formed as the “New Wali City” where, according to several informants, the seven tombs brought more blessings than religious tourism to Wali Songo in Java. This article specifically constructs Bali as a new halal tourist destination for the discovery of seven new guardian tombs since they were first discovered in 1992.

This **research** is also based on the two sub-corpus that construct Bali as the new Wali City as a halal tourism destination. *First*, finding the tomb of a holy person and his cult as a 'sainthood' and the dissemination of this information among tourists and the surrounding community. The construction of the discovery of a new guardian has the opportunity as a new halal tourist destination that emphasises the aspect of religious diversity where the worship of Islamic saints is at the heart of Hindu civilization.

Second, a new variant of "pilgrimage" in Islam other than the Hajj and Umrah pilgrimages is based on the Indonesian locality, namely the guardian pilgrimage. Indonesian people recognise the wali pilgrimage as an alternative to the spiritual needs of the community to visit places that are sacred and sacred to get blessings. 87.18% of the total Muslim population in Indonesia (Aini dkk., 2019, hlm. 198) besides carrying out Islamic law (such as prayer, fasting, zakat, etc.) Also travels for religious tourism as a spiritual need. The terms "Wali Songo pilgrimage", "wali limo pilgrimage" are more popular than the pilgrimage of the Prophet's tomb in Medina, which requires greater costs and long waiting times (Fournié, 2019; Handriana dkk., 2019). Although this pilgrimage is opposed by some experts that the pilgrimage legalised by Islam is Hajj and Umrah, no pilgrimage or tourism is sanctioned by God but a trip to the Temple of Allah (Mecca and Medina). There is an expansion of the spectrum of Muslim religious travel beyond the 'official holy journey' that is legalised by religion (El-Gohary, 2016; Luz, 2020). Pilgrimage is no longer just a release for spiritual needs to visit holy places, but also as a vehicle for tourism and the practice of consumerizing primary needs such as shopping for fashion goods, photography events for business models, and visits to luxury places. Thimm calls it a pilgrimage of modernity (Thimm, 2018).

The two constructions above show that the Wali Pitu pilgrimage is a discovery of religious tourism destinations where the context of sacred locality is used to promote halal tourism amidst the hegemony of Balinese Hinduism. Wali Pitu's halal tourism makes 'Indonesian Islam' different from 'Arabic Islam' or 'Middle Eastern Islam' (Geertz, 1971). Therefore, it is the sacred locality of Wali Bali that makes Balinese Islam different from other forms of Islam in Indonesia, such as Javanese Islam with Wali Songo. This article uses a qualitative approach by extracting data as observations made through the participation of researchers following three trips to Wali Pitu. On the first and second trips, the researchers explored information about the whereabouts of Wali Pitu based on information from the management of the al-Jamali foundation in Sidoarjo. Interviews were conducted during a meeting with the al-Jamali foundation, religious leaders, and the Wali Pitu tour guide in Malang, as well as several pilgrims who joined the group on the third trip. This study will also re-examine the views of pilgrims who have done religious tours to Wali Songo in Java and Wali Pitu in Bali based on their spiritual experiences and what they have gained.

This article also offers a form of "new sainthood" pilgrimage, besides the Wali Songo pilgrimage. There is a lot of literature on halal tourism based on wali pilgrimages in Indonesia that focus on Wali Songo in Java (Fournié, 2019; Handriana dkk., 2019; Kasdi, 2018, 2021). The history of guardians in the process of Islamization in other parts of the archipelago has received less attention, resulting in the holy's popularity man making pilgrims less interested in visiting their tombs. The holiness of the Wali Pitu in Bali is a transcendent thing, where Bali is known as the heart of Hindu civilization. Some tombs of the Wali Pitu in Bali are also next to a *pura* of Hindu worship. This study will fill this gap by examining the opportunities for new halal tourist destinations based on the Seven Muslim Sainthood which are at the heart of the centre of Hindu civilization in Indonesia.

Hātif - explain this term as a Note in the footer section of the page and Discovery of the Bali Pitu Wali Site

Wali Pitu Bali is a new burial site that is sacred by the Muslim society. This discovery was not created as the existence of Wali Songo in Java was proven by history and archaeological evidence (Hasyim, 2021). Finding Wali Pitu is unique, with a new method in the ancient Islamic tradition called *hātif*. There has been no specific study from experts who examine *hātif* as one method of discovery, so the saints are sacred. The discovery of Wali Pitu is a narrative built by traditionalists, in this case, Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) to save the seven people who are considered "wali or sainthood" as intermediaries between humans and God.

Before discussing *hātif*, the narratives built by traditionalists were opposed by modernists (such as Muhammadiyah) who considered these actions to be mystical deviations and included polytheistic (or called *syirik*). The differences in principles and sources of evidence between traditionalists and modernists are irreconcilable in this context. As an example, when the researcher confirmed that one informant we accidentally met was a follower of the modernists, he said:

"The cult of the Wali is not basic, there are no firm arguments from the two sources of Islamic law (al-Qur'ān and Ḥadīth), it could be that the whispers received are 'whispers of the devil', don't be deceived, need to be careful and validated by sharia" (interview with informant A6).

The traditionalists hold to the *hātif* as one of the essential methods for the narrative of holiness, while the reformists consider it an aberration in religious mysticism. As long as the observations were made, the narrative clashes about Wali Pitu's discovery with *hātif* were not as crowded as in Java. This may be because of the status of the Muslim minority in Bali, which is not much in contact with various other different Islamic groups. However, it is possible that the debate will occur, considering that both NU and Muhammadiyah have also opened branches in Bali. Such as PWNU Bali, which is in Pemecutan Klod Denpasar and PMW Muhammadiyah, which is the center of the Muhammadiyah branch in Denpasar and Badung. Even so, NU is more popular in Bali because its ideology is open to Balinese cultural traditions and religious diversity, which is more accepted by Balinese people (Howe, 2005).

By using *hātif*, the efforts of traditionalist groups seem to want to authenticate the discovery of saints based on imagination as an effort to confirm the existence of Wali Pitu in Bali, although this has received fierce debate from historians and religious experts. The dimension of locality, such as in Bali, has obscured the fierce normative debate about religious authentication (Stauth & Schielke, 2008). Traditional Balinese Muslims have adopted a new method of finding holy people's tombs as their strategy to build a more established Balinese Muslim identity and connect it with the wider transnational Muslim community. The distinctiveness of Balinese Muslim identity lies in its Islamic roots from the discovery of the tombs of the seven saints who are sacred in Islam but lie at the heart of Hindu civilization.

The discovery of the seven guardian tombs with *hātif* imagination is very interesting, especially since the locations of the seven tombs are far from strong Islamic civilization, even Bali is considered a "land of infidelity" by statements of radical groups who make Bali a *land of jihad* (Milla dkk., 2013). The existence of the guardian pitu was detected between 1992 and 1995 when a businessman who had a small foundation in Sidoarjo heard a *hātif* (in Arabic terms interpreted as a 'whisper' which is believed to be a message from God) telling him to gradually find the seven tombs of the guardian pitu. Together with his students, Toyyib Zaen Arifin (otherwise known as Arifin) founded a small pesantren al-Khoiriyah Sidoarjo to preach Islam in Gerbangkertosusila, a metropolitan gateway city in East Java. His introduction to Bali was when Arifin was interested in visiting Bali because there was a Balinese Muslim whose family was still Hindu.

When in Bali, Arifin was well received by the local society. As a novice kyai, Arifin then initiated the formation of the *Manaqib al-Jamali*, an association such as recitation (in Javanese tradition) which specifically reads the verses of Shaykh Abdul Qadir al-Jailani's spiritual journey. The word 'Jamali' in naming the manaqib formed by Arifin is an abbreviation of Java, Madura and Bali which means the close relationship of Muslim brotherhood from Java, Madura and Bali, from which Arifin often goes back and forth from Sidoarjo to Bali just to attend the manaqib he leads. Apparently, it was after Arifin established the manaqib that *hātif* descended on him as a blessing from God.

The first *hātif* that is received immediately shows the five saints of the seven saints. This first whisper was in Javanese, which Arifin received in 1992, which he heard almost consecutively for three nights:

Hātif whispering sentence:

"In telata Bali iku kawengku makam pitu piro wali cubo wujudno !..."

"Ono sawijining pepunden dumunung ono ing telatah susunanging siti sasandingan pamujaan agung kang manggon sak duwuring tirta kang kadarbeni dining suwitaning pandito ojo sumelang !..."

"Waspadakno pitu iku keparang dadi papat..."

"Pitu iku keparang dadi papat iku pengertenane: kapisan wus kaporo nyoto, kapindo istidroj wujud kembar, kaping telu wus lair naning durung wujud, kaping papat liyo bongso"

Meanings:

"In the land of Bali there are Seven Muslim Sainthood, try to find!..."

"There is a pepunden shrine in a place on a mound above the water beside a Hindu temple guarded by a faithful priest, so don't hesitate !..."

"Look, the seven are divided into four..."

"The seven sainthoods are divided into four: the first implies that they have existed for a long time, the second is highly respected and twins, the third has been born but has not yet seen his guardianship, and the fourth is from abroad".

Based on the instructions from the *hātif* sentence above, the tomb identified as the tomb of Wali Pitu is "... has existed for a long time", implying that this First Sainthood has existed in Bali since ancient times. Arifin then did a kind of contemplation to get inner guidance, and with the help of his manaqib congregation members. Tracking was carried out for several weeks by word of mouth. They finally found the tomb of Mas Sepuh as the First Sainthood near Saseh beach, in the southern area of Tanah Lot Bali. At that location, Arifin also found two other tombs known to the public as the tombs of Ratu Ayu Anak Agung Rai (his Islamic name is Dewi Khadijah) and Sosrodiningrat. It is not

known for certain what the relationship between the two tombs is with the tomb of the sainthood at that location, but based on information from the *hātif* received by Arifin, that the two tombs do not belong to the Wali.

Information that developed during the search for Mas Sepuh's tomb to residents revealed the sainthood was the son of King Mengwi and his Muslim wife from the Blambangan, Banyuwangi. According to society stories got by Arifin and the caretaker of the tomb (*jurukunci*), Mas Sepuh was a prince who was raised by his mother in Blambangan in a Muslim environment, but he did not know that his father was a King of Mengwi. As an adult, he was told by his mother that his father was a king, and so he went to Bali to meet his father. On the way to Seseh, Mas Sepuh was attacked by a group of people and finally, a battle broke out. Mas Sepuh then raised his *keris* to the sky and suddenly a tremendous power appeared which resulted in a group of people who attacked him instantly dying and some running away from Mas Sepuh. It is not known for certain why Mas Sepuh died in Seseh, whether it was because he was injured in a fight with a group of unknown people or because Mas Sepuh had lived for some time in Seseh and died. But the story was developing, Mas Sepuh's power that emerged from the sky when he defeated a group of people who attacked him was believed to be a sacred gift given by God to him.

The second tomb which is believed to be the tomb of the Second Sainthood was found based on the second *hātif* which reads: "*Ono sawijining pepunden dumunung ono ing telatah susunanging siti sasandingan pamujaan agung...*". information from Kyai Haji Nur Hadi who told Arifin that there is a sacred tomb whose sacredness is described next to the tomb so that it is possible for people to know it, the tomb is Yusuf al-Maghribi which is on Tapak Hill, Candikuning village, Baturiti sub-district, Bedugul Bali. Before arriving at the tomb site, one must pass through the wilderness and Tapak Hill which is a protected forest area managed by the Natural Resources Conservation Agency (BKSDA - *Badan Konservasi Sumber Daya Alam*), exactly as stated in the *hātif* sentence: "*ono ing telatah ...*" which means location Yusuf al-Maghribi's tomb is on the Tapak Hill which is a real mound of earth. Yusuf al-Maghribi is better known to the public as *Sheikh Bedugul*. Yusuf al-Maghribi is said to have been the King of Beratan in the 15th century.

Based on information from Faridin, a caretaker of the tomb (*jurukunci*) said Yusuf al-Maghribi's tomb was found 53 years ago by residents looking for firewood. Since it was discovered, this tomb has not been very well known to residents, but according to reports from several residents to Faridin that there is something mystical that is felt when residents make a pilgrimage to the tomb of Yusuf al-Maghribi. It was only after Arifin met community leaders and Faridin in Bedugul that Yusuf al-Maghribi's tomb was visited by pilgrims. It is said that sacredness is felt, including not being allowed to do bad things on the way to Tapak Hill, such as saying rude and dirty words, thinking badly, and cutting trees carelessly. If the prohibition is violated, something will happen to that person so that people know the tomb of Yusuf al-Maghribi as the Bedugul Sacred Tomb. Since it was proclaimed by Arifin as one tomb of Wali Pitu, the tomb area has been built with a prayer room, a place for ablution, a resting place, and several canteens for the needs of pilgrims. In particular, the Bedugul Sacred Tomb is the responsibility of the Banjar indigenous people in Candikuning II. The discovery of the first and second tombs occurred around 1993, a year after Arifin received his *hātif*.

The following year, in 1994, Arifin looking for the tomb of Third Sainthood moved towards the southeastern coast of Bali where there is a Muslim village in Kusambe. Unlike before, the tomb of Third Sainthood is in a public cemetery in Karangasem, but people already know this tomb because of its sacredness. By doing meditation and contemplation for a year, Arifin got a clue and got a *hātif* where he ventured to look for the third tomb. The surrounding community named the tomb the Kusambeh Sacred Tomb in which there was a respected figure in his day named Habib Ali bin Abu Bakar bin Umar bin Abu Bakr al-Hamid.

Habib Ali is the Third Sainthood who comes from the *sāda* or *sayyid* circles who is nicknamed *Habib* (meaning: 'beloved') which is an honorary title given to a descendant of the Prophet Muhammad PBUH. Habib Ali's arrival in Kusambeh was ordered by Raden Patah in Demak to spread Islam to the region in the 15th century. Incidentally, the expedition sent by Raden Patah was a preacher who mostly came from Pasuruan, East Java, including Habib Ali. Habib Ali's da'wah began when he became a Malay language teacher at the Klungkung palace whose king was Dewa Agung Jambé I. Because Habib Ali's skills in teaching and the King was satisfied with his servants, he was finally given a horse good gift which was a horse from one of his children (prince). Seeing the attitude of the father (King) who so glorified Habib Ali, there was a conspiracy to kill Habib Ali. The king knew this and ordered Habib Ali to leave the palace. But on the way, Habib Ali was killed by a group of assassins and finally, he died near Kusambeh. On the night that the murder took place, a fireball emerged from his tomb and hunted down the killers of Habib Ali. Since then, many people have told this incident from generation to generation, so it's no wonder that on top of Habib Ali's tomb there is a statue of a person riding a horse.

After the discovery of the three sainthoods or Wali, Arifin felt his struggle was not over, but he had to face a problem, namely it was difficult to find the next tombs which according to the *hātif* he received, the next tomb was not specifically explained by clearer signs or instructions. There is only a sentence: "...*dining suwitaning pandito...*" so there

is a tomb guarded by a priest or loyal follower; and the sentence: "...kapindo istidroj *wujude kembar*..." so the next group of tombs is *istidroj* or so revered and the tombs are twins. Arifin had a hard time solving this puzzle because there were no obvious clues about the place markings as in the tomb of the Third Sainthood, namely his tomb is on a mound or hill. However, from this Arifin got a little inspiration that there is a correlation between the third tomb with the fourth and fifth tombs, namely lies in *istidroj* which according to Arifin's opinion is the same as the Third Guardian, they are both one of them or both are *sāda* or *sayyid* circles.

The distance is rather long, unlike searching for the first, second and third tombs, searching for the fourth and fifth tombs was only carried out by Arifin in 1995 when he had other *hātif* to immediately search for the two tombs. Sure enough, Arifin was met with Gufron who told him about a sacred tomb of Arab descent named Habib Ali bin Zainal Abidin al-Idrus. Arifin indeed thought in his meditation before the investigation that the next tomb was an *istidroj* who was so respected as in the discovery of the Third Guardian because he was a *sayyid* with the title Habib. The discovery of this tomb is in an area inhabited by Sasak Muslims, namely in the village of Bungaya Kangin, Karangasem which is the eastern region of Bali.

One sentence in the *hātif* is "twin tombs", which is the hardest thing for Arifin to find because none of them refers to this meaning. However, an unexpected incident occurred when Arifin spoke with Habib Ali al-Idrus' son, Habib Muhdlor. He told Arifin that there was a tomb that was older than his father's tomb that came first. But who is buried there has not been revealed clearly because his tomb is anonymous and no one in the society knows about it? After going through a search and discussion process with several prominent 'ulama in Java and Bali for six months, it was revealed that the tomb is Sheikh Maulana Yusuf al-Baghdi al-Maghribi, estimated to be 450 years old. Based on the names of al-Baghdi and al-Maghribi, this Fifth Sainthood came from the Baghdad region of Iraq who travelled to Bali. It is not known the history of Sheikh Yusuf al-Baghdi, but the existence of these two tombs (the tomb of Habib Ali al-Idrus and the tomb of Sheikh Yusuf al-Baghdi) was designated by Arifin as the tomb of the Fourth and Fifth Sainthood. What can be concluded here about the "twin tombs" and "guarded by a faithful priest" is the figure of Habib Ali al-Idrus as the guardian of the tomb of Sheikh Yusuf al-Baghdi, both of whom died and were buried close together.

Because of Arifin's persistence in searching for the graves of the seven Wali Pitu, Habib Muhdlor then accompanied Arifin to search for the tomb of the Sixth Sainthood in the same year (in 1995) to the Singaraja area. With the help of Habib Muhdlor's brother, Habib Muhammad showed a sacred tomb in a Chinese cemetery near a Pura Agung Labuhan Aji in the Temukus Harbor area. At first, Arifin hesitated because a Wali couldn't be from China, but then Arifin received the next *hātif* which informed him that the tomb was Kwan Lie or his Islamic name known as Sheikh Abdul Qodir Muhammad. Kwan Lie was one of the three bodyguards sent by Emperor Hong Zhi (1470-1505) to escort his daughter Ong Tien to Sunan Gunung Djati in Java because Ong Tien fell in love with Sunan. The three bodyguards later converted to Islam and became disciples of Sunan Gunung Djati to spread Islam. Arifin then became convinced that the tomb of the Sixth Sainthood came from the Chinese who were buried in North Bali, precisely in Temukus village, Banjar sub-district, Buleleng regency, Bali. The tomb of the Sixth Sainthood was later known as the *Makam Keramat Karang Rumpit (the Karang Kupit Sacred Tomb)*.

The search for the last grave as the Seventh Guardian was carried out by Arifin before his death in December 2001. The last *hātif* whisper he received was "...*wis lair namung durung wujud*..." meaning that the Seventh Sainthood is still alive, and his guardianship will appear after he has died. In Islam, this term is called *qobla al-wujud* or, before its appearance it is predictable. Arifin accepted the next *hātif* which confirmed that the location of the seventh tomb was in Jembrana, and the followers of manaqib al-Jamali were asked to wait for his appearance after the person in question died. On March 29, 1999, a 'ulama' in Jembrana descended from Hadrami named Sayyid Ali bin Umar bin Abubakar Bafaqih. As in the Third and Fourth Sainthood, the name of the Seventh Sainthood has pinned 'sayyid' as a sign that he is from the descendants of the Prophet Muhammad PBUH (or *sāda*). However, in our interviews with some of al-Jamali's followers, Arifin in 1998 had met face-to-face with Sayyid Ali Bafaqih a year before the death of the Wali.

Sayyid Ali Bafaqih is an 'ulamā' of Hadhrami descent who was born in Banyuwangi in 1910. His educational background started from studying in Mecca and continuing to the Pesantren Tambakberas in Jombang. After studying, Sayyid Ali Bafaqih founded the Pondok Pesantren Syamsul Huda Loloan or more popularly known as the Pesantren Loloan in Jembrana Bali. Because of his expertise in religious knowledge, Sayyid Ali Bafaqih is better known as a Wali because of his knowledge than his sacredness.

"City of Wali": Bali's New Icon

Bali is known by the world as the most popular tourist destination (Adhika, 2021; Mastika, 2020; Pamungkas, 2020). Its natural and cultural wealth invites many tourists from all over the world to travel to Bali (Dunbar-Hall, 2001; McKean, 2011; Picard, 2008). The international society calls Bali a representation of "paradise on earth" where the

natural, cultural, and social beauty of the people supports these preferences (Fagertun, 2017; Lorenzen, 2015; Mohsin, 2017). Bali is also popularly known as the “Pulau Dewata” or island of the Gods because of the many Hindu temples or places of worship scattered in various places, in people’s homes, in government offices, on roadsides, markets, and other places which identifies Bali as a Hindu island (Dibia, 1985). Although the majority are Hindus, Bali is known as an area that has high religious tolerance, as evidenced because inter-religious religions coexist in one area without interreligious conflict (Arjawa, 2021; Pedersen, 2014; Tohari & Raya, 2021).

However, this profile turned contradictory when Bali was rocked by the Bali Bombings I and II on October 12, 2002, and October 1, 2005, by terrorist groups (Korstanje, 2011). Bali became the most tragic city where the two nights witnessed how sadistic acts of terrorism destroyed Bali. Sublimation effects on the economy, security and stability of the country, as well as prolonged psychological effects, are felt by victims of the bombing and family members and surrounding society (Brookes, 2014; Hutchison, 2010; G. J. Stevens dkk., 2013). Needs a very long time to psychologically recover from the bloody incident (Kruglanski, 2013; G. Stevens, 2013). After the Bali Bombings, the tension of relations between Hindus and Muslims again occurred were both experienced social disintegration in various ways, especially the traumatic effects, severance of business and economic relations, to the social isolation of Muslims in Bali (G. J. Stevens dkk., 2013). The icon of Bali as a tourism city, heaven on earth, city of tolerance, was destroyed because of this bloody event (Lewis, 2006; Sobocinska, 2011; Suryani, 2009). The disappearance of this icon seems to be a trigger for the spirit of Bali to restore its reputation as the most desirable city in the world because of its culture and diversity.

The completion of the search, Arifin found the seven Wali Pitu tomb sites coincided with the Bali Bombing incident, which caused the prospect of halal tourism to drastically decrease. One informant we met in Denpasar who did not want to be identified said that among these seven sites no local pilgrims visited, and we checked with Parahita Tour that there were no religious tours to Wali Pitu from 2002 to 2004. At the time of the incident The second Bali bombing occurred in 2005, practically the tomb site of Wali Pitu experienced an independent closure (it is not known how long), but it was confirmed that Parahita Tour received a visit to Wali Pitu in 2007.

The visit to Wali Pitu strengthened again after a wave of pilgrimages was echoed by one of the Islamic organisations, namely Nahdlatul ‘Ulama’ (NU) to promote the pilgrimage of the Wali as a religious tourism destination (Slama, 2012), supported when religious tourism became a research project carried out by the government in 2006 (Pusat Penelitian dan Pengembangan Keparawisataan, 2006), which is based on the need for religious tourism as property rights for religious wealth and religious life that has long been owned by a pluralistic Indonesian society, needs to be realised as capital in building peace. The position of Wali Pitu as a religious tourism destination continued to be promoted by several parties, such as the al-Jamali foundation as the founder of Wali Pitu. East. Likewise, travel agents are aggressively opening tourism vacancies and tours to Bali dissertation on religious tourism to various Islamic historical sites to attract more customers from the Muslim community. Tight business competition for travel agents who provide tours to Wali Songo has opened travel agents to choose Wali Pitu as a new destination where people know little about Wali Pitu.

Like Parahita Tour, other travel agency bureaus such as Bali Halal Tour which provides special halal travel to Bali, and all services provided are also halal-based, halal drivers, halal food, and tourist destinations and religious objects. On Jl Raya Kuta 299, Badung Bali, Bali Halal Tour was founded by Syamsuddin and Hadian in response to a request from their Muslim relatives who suggested that religious tourism travel vacancies be opened, because some of their relatives hesitate to eat food that is doubtful of halal when visiting Bali, and various tourist attraction that does not support Muslims to visit there. Starting from information about Wali Pitu found by a figure from Sidoarjo, in 2010 finally established Bali Halal Tour.

Various parties involved in the promotion of Wali Pitu as a halal tourist destination in Bali such as the al-Jamali foundation with the al-Khoiriyah Islamic boarding school and its manaqib association, researchers from within and outside the country, the emergence of travel agency bureaus to Wali Pitu, and pilgrims who come from inside and outside Bali, has made Wali Pitu known to the wider society. Besides being the Pulau Dewata (Island of the Gods), Bali is now known as the City of Wali, where Islam is spread in a minority by the Walis amid the hegemony of the Hindu society and the center of its civilization.

Wali Pitu Bali as a New Halal Tourism Prospect in Indonesia

A tradition that develops in Indonesian society, pilgrimage is visiting places that are sacred, mostly done on tombs that are sacred and bring blessings to those who visit them (Chambert-Loir, 2002; Doorn-Harder & Jong, 2006; Jonge, 1998; Masduki, 2018), rather than the *Haji* and *Umrah* pilgrimages which are formally legalised in Islam (to Mecca and Medina) (El-Gohary, 2016; Luz, 2020). Popular pilgrimage sites visited are the tombs of Wali Songo which

are scattered throughout Java. The existence of the site of the sainthood is an economic and business opportunity for the prospect of religious tourism.

Tourism is a trip carried out with the aim of recreation or holiday, religious tourism should relax one's religious understanding so that it is more profound in interpreting life by visiting places that are sacred. The tomb sites of the sainthood also have a political opportunity where the government makes these sites by establishing a "halal tourism" policy (Widjaja, 2020). Halal tourism is finally used by the government as a branding of the potential of the region to maintain their authority in the eyes of the public.

Halal tourism regulation as formal legality has difficulties. Issuing Law Number 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism and Law Number 33 of 2014 concerning Guarantee of Halal Products is a complement to the legal umbrella so that halal tourism is constitutionally recognised. However, it does not specifically explain halal tourism. Regulations on halal tourism are weak because there are no specific policies on halal tourism at the level of laws or government regulations. As in the Minister's Regulation of Tourism and Creative Economy Number 2 of 2014 concerning Guidelines for implementing Sharia Hotels, which are only devoted to business units to support halal tourism. However, the regulation was revoked and replaced with Minister of Tourism Regulation Number 11 of 2016 concerning the Implementation of Tourism Certification, these two policies did not specifically discuss halal tourism. Seeing the absence of specific regulations for halal tourism, finally, the National Sharia Council (DSN – *Dewan Syariah Nasional*) of the MUI (Indonesian Ulema Council) in 2016 issued a fatwa for halal tourism under Number 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 concerning Guidelines for implementing Tourism Based on Sharia Principles. The fatwa regulates all sharia tourism activities, starting from the contract carried out, hotels, tourist destinations, SPA, sauna, massage services, travel agencies, to tour guides.

However, the Wali Pitu site attracts fewer pilgrims than the already popular Wali Songo site. The existence of Wali Pitu has not been widely exposed since it was first gradually discovered by Arifin in 1992. Wali Songo is visited by millions of people from all over Indonesia and abroad, while Wali Pitu is only visited by a few hundred people. The existence of Wali Songo in the centre of Muslim civilization in Java and government support makes the Wali Songo tomb site well maintained, in contrast to the tomb site of Wali Pitu which is not well maintained and the environment does not support the site which is at the heart of Balinese Hindu civilization.

Wali Songo and Wali Pitu are two connected aspects. The analogy is that Kwan Lie (or Sheikh Abdul Qodir Muhammad) is a student of Sunan Gunung Djati, this connection is also strengthened by Barth where Habib Ali bin Abu Bakar bin Umar bin Abu Bakr al-Hamid is considered a descendant of Sunan Ampel (Barth, 1998). This connection led Arifin to establish Manaqib Al-Jamali (for the Javanese, Madurese, and Balinese communities) so that the community does not focus on the locality of Bali only, Java and Madura as national pilgrims must be involved in promoting Wali Pitu. Since the discovery of Wali Pitu by Arifin, the income got from pilgrims has also increased. Several travel agents for the Wali Pitu destination have been opened to offer the public a new alternative to the Wali Songo site. We interviewed one of the organizers of the religious tourism agency Wali Pitu:

"The pilgrims I invited to the Wali Pitu pilgrimage in 2016 seemed doubtful because information about the *karomah* of Wali Pitu had not been widely heard, plus their location in Bali would allow the Walis to be at the center of Hindu civilization. Then there were about 17 people who were interested in joining my invitation. After they travel, there is a special impression that is different from a pilgrimage to Wali Songo. Different spiritual impressions and effects after doing the pilgrimage in doing business and work which they call "barokahe Wali Pitu" (Interview on 29 June 2019 with Kyai Nasron Hakim).

Since news broke about several religious trips to Wali Pitu, the al-Jamali foundation has been increasingly sought after by people. Their motive, apart from *sowan* (visiting) to Toyyib Zaen Arifin also asked about the sacredness of Wali Pitu. Not infrequently, the pilgrims also stay at the accommodation provided by the al-Jamali foundation in Denpasar, and this is the only primary income of the al-Jamali foundation. This foundation also cooperates with Parahita Tour for tours to Wali Pitu. There are three travel packages offered by Parahita Tour: (1) Overland Wali Pitu 1 Night Package; (2) Overland Wali Pitu 2 Night Package; and (3) Sainthood Pilgrimage. This travel agency provides private tours (for those who want privacy when travelling), tourist buses (includes bus fleet, drivers, and fuel oil/BBM), entrance tickets to tourist attractions (including bus parking and donations on the highway), including hotels or lodging, eating and drinking, as well as tour guides. The rates provided also vary based on the number of pilgrims taking part. Price Rp. 763,000 per person with 32 participants, Rp. 666,000 per person with 40 participants, Rp. 627,000 per person with 45 participants, Rp. 591,000 per person with 50 participants, Rp. 562,000 per person with 55 participants, and Rp. 543,000 per person with 59 participants.

Besides the location of the tomb of Wali Pitu, Parahita Tour provides refreshing to Joger as a souvenir centre for T-shirts with the theme of Wali Pitu in Lulus, heading to Bedugul and visiting the Gélgél Mosque, Klungkung. Like

the Wali Songo pilgrimage, pilgrims can bring souvenirs typical of Wali Pitu Bali with T-shirts from Joger. According to Kyai Nasron Hakim, as a guide and organizer of the Wali Pitu tour, he has prepared a brochure containing what destinations to visit in Bali along with a brief explanation of the Wali's biography and his sacredness. In addition, just like the book 'Cerita Wali Songo' which was written and published by a local merchant community, a book about Wali Pitu has also been duplicated by a local Posmo journalist, an activist for Islamic Sufism, Husni Mufid and his editor Yusuf Suharto, who published a book entitled "Wali Pitu & Wali Enam di Pulau Bali" which is, of course, different from the original printed book from Toyyib Zaen Arifin the founder of Wali Pitu, because Husni Mufid expanded Wali in Bali to Thirteen (with the addition of Six Wali or sainthood) (Husnu, 2011). Apart from journalists and book writers, Husni Mufid is also a tour guide for the Wali Songo and Wali Pitu travel agencies, while Yusuf Suharto helps promote Wali Pitu and Wali Enam to the *nahdliyin* community at the Aswaja Center in East Java.

Pilgrims come from the lower classes, as in our interview with mothers who will join our group at Wali Pitu:

"I've never been to Bali... I heard why there was a tomb of Wali Pitu, he said. After the pilgrimage there, my neighbour's merchandise was selling well. Then I was invited by Gus Nasron, so I went. It's not bad that it's a blessing to also get a tour..." (Interview with Mrs Sarti, a resident of Kalipare Malang village on January 11, 2019)

Kyai Nasron said that Mrs Sarti is a housewife who works as a farm labourer in her village with her husband, Mr Mairan. Hearing the news that a trip to Wali Pitu was opened, Mrs Sarti's motivation to join was to get a blessing and visit the tourist island of Bali. After visiting Wali Pitu Bali, we asked Mrs Sarti for a testimonial about her religious tourism trip to Bali, she said:

"Very Interesting... I didn't find the sensation of making a pilgrimage like I usually do to Wali Songo. There is a thick sacred impression that is felt like when visiting the tomb of Sunan Kalijaga in Kadilangu, Demak, East Java..."

On next trip to Wali Pitu which was held in mid-February 2019, Mrs. Sarti along with her siblings and two children joined the group. Apparently, Mrs. Sarti's first trip left such a deep impression that she returned to make a pilgrimage to Wali Pitu. As stated by Lemy, et.al, Bali is a tourist destination that invites a lot of interest and deep impressions so that tourists will return to Bali to the same place or try new places. What Lemi calls the push and pull motivation that causes someone to be loyal to travel to Bali (Lemy dkk., 2020). On the sidelines of the previous visit to Sheikh Yusuf Maghribi, Parahita Tour stopped its bus fleet to tourist attractions such as Kuta Beach and Sukawati Art Market. Religious tourism trips to Wali Pitu combine at least two elements between religion and leisure tourism.

Wali Pitu Bali: A Portrait of Contemporary Religious Moderation

Bali is a city with the heart of Hindu civilization in Indonesia, most of its people since ancient times are thick with traditional Hindu traditions (Picard, 2011b). The existence of Wali Pitu at the centre of Hindu civilization creates a kind of what is called Tohari and Raya as resilience (Tohari & Raya, 2021). The tension caused by the Bali Bombings I in 2002 and the Bali Bombings II in 2005 is a sound basis for friction between religious communities in Bali to falter. The heartbreaking incident 19 years ago still leaves deep wounds for the international community, and also has a terrible impact on Muslim-Hindu relations in Bali (Pedersen, 2014). The ISIM Newsletter from Leiden University reported that tensions between Hindu-Muslim relations in Bali had existed since 1958, but the seeds of hatred had re-emerged after the Bali Bombing tragedy (Ramstedt, 1999). Muslims in Bali received some kind of intervention and "social isolation" by the Hindu majority in various fields of life, such as social and economic activities (Tohari & Raya, 2021).

Viewed from the perspective of local customs, the existence of Muslim tombs especially sacred figures (Wali) at the heart of Hindu civilization, is very contradictory if the spread of Islam is carried out, as in Java. Wali Songo is swallowed by the community because of the similarities in culture, race, and social way of life. Meanwhile, in Bali, there are customary claims that limit Islamic culture to be easily accepted there. Efforts to maintain good relations between Hindu-Islamic people have existed for a long time since King Cokorda Pemecutan III in the early 17th century, when the Bugis Muslim diaspora waded to Bali because of the pressure of Dutch colonialism. The King Cokorda Pemecutan III gave land to the Bugis Muslim community to live in Pemecutan, and the King himself built a mosque for Muslims.

Wali Pitu is tolerance in religion that is created naturally. In the book Wali Pitu, written by Toyyib Zaen Arifin himself, he asserts that the existence of the tombs of the Seven Sainthood is a manifestation of religious and cultural acculturation through an attitude of tolerance (Arifin, 2011). In the book, there is an emphasis on harmonious relations between Hindu-Muslims through the history of the life of the Seven Guardians. In every process of finding Wali Pitu since 1992, Arifin said: "Every door we knock on to search for the seven Wali tombs in Bali, we have our Hindu brothers

and sisters”; a statement showing that Wali Pitu was very well received by the Hindu community. With the approval of most of the Hindu community, the legality of Wali Pitu was finally recognised by the government through the Bali Provincial Tourism Office and the Bali Province Ministry of Religion.

The portrait of religion in the historical story of Wali Pitu is depicted in Mas Sepuh and Habib Ali al-Hamid. *Pandito* or the guard Mas Sepuh is a Hindu, and Habib Ali al-Hamid's horse was a gift from the King Dewa Agung Jambe I (or King Klungkung). As well as a statue depicting Habib Ali al-Hamid riding a horse around the tomb complex made by a Hindu. And the next portrait is also depicted on the last Wali who comes from China, who is predominantly Confucian. In another story, Arifin's version, there is a female guardian (as told by Posmo journalists) namely Raden Ayu Siti Khodijah, a daughter of Puri Pemecutan who was killed because of a misperception when Raden Ayu Siti Khodijah was praying. In the takbir, “Allahu Akbar” is considered by the Hindu community as a *leak* spell for black magic rituals. His sacred tomb to this day attracts local pilgrims, both Muslim and Hindu and international (from some researchers such as Martin Slama). The tomb of Raden Ayu Siti Khodijah is sacred by Hindus because the princess from Puri Pemecutan is a woman who became a bone of contention for men and Hindu figures in her day because of her beauty and breadth of knowledge. His Islam was related to the efforts of the King (father) when he was sick to open a contest, whoever healed him would be rewarded by marrying Raden Ayu Siti Khodijah, and finally, Hindus made a Hindu version of the book entitled *Sejarah “Keramat Agung Pemecutan” Makam Raden Ayu Pemecutan alias Raden Ayu Siti Khotijah*.

Other religious portraits are the tomb of Habib Ali al-Idrus in Klungkung and Sayyid Ali Bafaqih from Loloan who is a descendant of Hadrami. These two sainthoods spread Islam to the Muslim minority community in Bali which could run smoothly on their da'wah journey, unlike the story of Mas Sepuh and Habib Ali al-Hamid (along with Raden Ayu Siti Khodijah the Posmo journalist version) which intersects with Balinese aristocrats. The genealogy of Habib Ali al-Idrus and Sayyid Ali Bafaqih as descendants of the Prophet Muhammad PBUH is considered the major capital to easily gain religious authority claims from local Muslims (Mandal, 1997). In the case of Habib Ali al-Idrus and Sayyid Ali Bafaqih, pilgrims and several members of the al-Jamali foundation with Javanese, Madurese, Bugis and Balinese backgrounds take part in the haul ceremony which is held every year.

If viewed carefully, Wali Pitu is a representation of inter-religious issues involving culture and religion as connectedness. Mas Sepuh as the First Sainthood is buried in a Hindu village (Saseh), the two Twin Sacred Tombs (Syekh Yusuf al-Baghdhi and Habib Ali al-Idrus) and Kwan Lie's tomb are in a mixed Hindu-Muslim village, as well as Wali Bedugul (Syekh Yusuf al-Idrus al-Maghribi) whose tomb is on the hill inhabited by Hindu and Muslim communities; they are a portrait of religious moderation in religious tourism.

Another portrait when there are two sentences of greeting displayed on the poster at the entrance of Kwan Lie's grave at Temukus Karang Kupit which reads “Assalamu’alaikum Wr. Wb.” in Islamic terms, and “Rahajeng Rawuh” in Balinese Hindu. According to Hari Purwanto, a key teacher at the Karang Kupit Sacred Tomb, explained that the poster was designed in such a way to welcome both Muslim and Hindu pilgrims to get along with each other and to convey the impression that Hindu-Islam is two brother religions. The poster also shows Hari Purwanto's face wearing Islamic clothes complete with a white cap, and Balinese traditional clothes on the left side. The poster shows that Wali Pitu is a representation of a portrait of diversity where religious and cultural symbols that are strongly attached do not become a barrier to providing open space for narratives of peace in the public sphere. Bali as a World Tourism City, a Hindu City, as well as a New Wali City is a representative model for other regions that want peace harmony amid diversity.

Conclusion

Indonesia was recently surprised by the discovery of the tomb of the Seven Sainthoods (*sab'ah al-'auliyā'*) or called Wali Pitu, which differs from Wali Songo in Java. The discovery of the tomb of Wali Pitu is allegedly unique because of its existence in the heart of Hindu civilization, and through an unusual process as in the cult of Wali Songo. As a new site for the worship of saints, Wali Pitu is a new prospect for alternative halal tourism opportunities that makes Bali have a double image as a new “City of Wali”. The personnel of the seven Walis who were found also invited a community of people who came from the three islands (Java, Madura, and Bali). More than just religious tourism, the Wali Pitu pilgrimage also creates a new cult narrative where the spiritual experience gained differs from the Wali Songo pilgrimage. The discovery of Wali Pitu can be understood as an attempt to moderate contemporary religion in which the Balinese Muslim minority has a very important role at the heart of Hindu civilization. Finally, the prospect of halal tourism through the pilgrimage of the Wali's grave as an effort for Muslim communities to build their spirituality and connectivity with the Muslim world of Southeast Asia. Wali Pitu is considered as an opportunity for halal tourism to build an image of Muslim holiness amid the hegemony and majority of Hindu community in Indonesia.

References

- Adhika, I. M. (2021). Reinigorating cultural landscapes for planning cultural tourism in Bali. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 33(4), 1462–1469. <https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.334spl03-594>
- Aini, N., Utomo, A., & McDonald, P. (2019). Interreligious Marriage in Indonesia. *Journal of Religion and Demography*, 6(1), 189–214. <https://doi.org/10.1163/2589742X-00601005>
- Ambary, H. M. (1985). Masjid Kampung Gelgel, Kabupaten Klungkung (Bali). *Archipel*, 30(1), 39–41. <https://doi.org/10.3406/arch.1985.2238>
- Arifin, C. T. Z. (2011). *Sejarah Wujudnya Makam Sab'atul Auliya' Wali Pitu di Bali (Sejarah Perkembangan dan Pengembangan)*. Zifatama Publishing.
- Arjawa, I. G. P. B. S. (2021). The social integration of hindu and muslim communities: The practice of *menyama-braya* in contemporary bali. *Studia Islamika*, 28(1), 149–178. <https://doi.org/10.36712/sdi.v28i1.10914>
- Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali. (2018). *Penduduk Provinsi Bali Menurut Agama yang Dianut Hasil Sensus Penduduk 2010*. Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali.
- Barth, F. (1998). *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries: The Social Organization of Culture Difference*. Waveland Press.
- Brookes, G. (2014). Terrorism, Trauma and Psychology: A Multilevel Victim Perspective of the Bali Bombings. Dalam *Terrorism, Trauma and Psychology: A Multilevel Victim Perspective of the Bali Bombings* (hlm. 192). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315765136>
- Chambert-Loir, H. (2002). Saints and Ancestors: The Cult of Muslim Saints in Java. Dalam *The Potent Dead*. Routledge.
- Dibia, I. W. (1985). Odalan of Hindu Bali: A Religious Festival, a Social Occasion, and a Theatrical Event. *Asian Theatre Journal*, 2(1), 61–65. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1124507>
- Doorn-Harder, N. V., & Jong, K. D. (2006). The Pilgrimage to Tembayat: Tradition and Revival in Islamic Mysticism in Contemporary Indonesia. Dalam *The Blackwell Companion to Contemporary Islamic Thought* (hlm. 482–506). John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470996188.ch29>
- Dunbar-Hall, P. (2001). Culture, tourism and cultural tourism: Boundaries and frontiers in performances of balinese music and dance. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 22(2), 173–187. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07256860120069594>
- El-Gohary, H. (2016). Halal tourism, is it really Halal? *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 19, 124–130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.013>
- Fagertun, A. (2017). Labour in Paradise: Gender, Class and Social Mobility in the Informal Tourism Economy of Urban Bali, Indonesia. *Journal of Development Studies*, 53(3), 331–345. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2016.1184248>
- Fournié, P. (2019). Rediscovering the Walisongo, Indonesia: A Potential New Destination for International Pilgrimage. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 7(4), Article 4. <https://doi.org/10.21427/g00f-qd76>
- Geertz, C. (1971). *Islam Observed: Religious Development in Morocco and Indonesia*. University of Chicago Press.
- Handriana, T., Yulianti, P., & Kurniawati, M. (2019). Exploration of pilgrimage tourism in Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(3), 783–795. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-10-2018-0188>
- Hasyim, A. W. (2021). Demak Sultanate: The Fortress of Islamic Greatness in the Middle Ages Java Island. *Buletin Al-Turas*, 27(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.15408/bat.v27i1.16400>
- Howe, L. (2005). *The Changing World of Bali: Religion, Society and Tourism*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203015421>
- Husnu, M. (2011). *Perjuangan Wali Pitu dan Wali Enam di Pulau Bali*. Menara Madinah.
- Hutchison, E. (2010). Trauma and the politics of emotions: Constituting identity, security and community after the Bali bombing. *International Relations*, 24(1), 65–86. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0047117809348712>
- Jonge, H. de. (1998). Pilgrimages and Local Islam on Java. *Studia Islamika*, 5(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v5i2.751>
- Kasdi, A. (2018). Wali City Branding: Marketing Strategy in Promoting Halal Tourism Destinations Demak Indonesia. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 25(2), 463–473. <https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.25215-373>
- Kasdi, A. (2021). Potential of Kudus as a new international pilgrimage destination in Indonesia: Halal tourism optimising local wisdom. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 9(1), 96–105. <https://doi.org/10.21427/6a93-zn19>
- Korstanje, M. (2011). Tourism, Development, and Terrorism in Bali. *e-Review of Tourism Research*, 9(2), 1–3.
- Kruglanski, A. W. (2013). Psychological Insights into Indonesian Islamic Terrorism: The What, the How and the Why of Violent Extremism. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology*, 16(2), 112–116. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajsp.12019>
- Lemy, D. M., Nursiana, A., & Pramono, R. (2020). Destination Loyalty Towards Bali. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(12), 501–508. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no12.501>
- Lewis, J. (2006). Paradise Defiled: The Bali Bombings and the Terror of National Identity. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 9(2), 223–242. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1367549406063165>

- Lorenzen, R. (2015). Paradise Contested: Culture, Politics and Changing Land and Water Use in Bali. *Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 16(2), 99–105. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2015.1006667>
- Luz, N. (2020). Pilgrimage and religious tourism in Islam. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 82, 102915. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.102915>
- Mandal, S. K. (1997). Natural leaders of native Muslims: Arab ethnicity and politics in Java under Dutch rule. *Hadrami Traders, Scholars and Statesmen in the Indian Ocean, 1750s-1960s*. New York: Brill.
- Masduki, A. (2018). *Ziarah Wali: An Inquiry of Contemporary Religious Tourism Development in Indonesia*. Travelling Muslims: NISIS Autumn School. <https://research.rug.nl/en/publications/ziarah-wali-an-inquiry-of-contemporary-religious-tourism-developm>
- Mastika, I. K. (2020). Destination branding model of an ecological tourism village in Bali, Indonesia. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 31(3), 1068–1074. <https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.31319-542>
- McKean, P. (2011). Tourism, culture change, and culture conservation in Bali. *Changing Identities in Modern Southeast Asia*, Query date: 2020-10-20 14:55:16, 237–248. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110809930.237>
- Milla, M. N., Faturachman, & Ancok, D. (2013). The impact of leader–follower interactions on the radicalization of terrorists: A case study of the Bali bombers. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology*, 16(2), 92–100. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajsp.12007>
- Mohsin, A. (2017). Lighting “paradise”: A sociopolitical history of electrification in Bali. *East Asian Science, Technology and Society*, 11(1), 9–34. <https://doi.org/10.1215/18752160-3489218>
- Pamungkas, K. (2020). Geotourism branding through the names of tourism destinations in UNESCO global geopark Batur Bali: Morphological and toponymic studies. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 31(3), 966–971. <https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.31305-528>
- Pedersen, L. (2014). 6 Keeping the Peace: Interdependence and Narratives of Tolerance in Hindu-Muslim Relationships in Eastern Bali. Dalam *Between Harmony and Discrimination: Negotiating Religious Identities within Majority-Minority Relationships in Bali and Lombok* (hlm. 165–196). Brill. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004271494_008
- Picard, M. (2008). Balinese identity as tourist attraction: From ‘cultural tourism’ (pariwisata budaya) to ‘Bali erect’ (ajeg Bali). *Tourist Studies*, 8(2), 155–173. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797608099246>
- Picard, M. (2011a). Balinese Religion in Search of Recognition: From “Agama Hindu Bali” to “Agama Hindu” (1945-1965). *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde*, 167(4), 482–510.
- Picard, M. (2011b). Balinese Religion in Search of Recognition: From “Agama Hindu Bali” to “Agama Hindu” (1945-1965). *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde*, 167(4), 482–510.
- Picard, M. (2011c). Balinese religion in search of recognition: From Agama Hindu Bali to Agama Hindu (1945-1965). *Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde / Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia*, 167(4), 482–510. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-90003581>
- Pusat Penelitian dan Pengembangan Kepariwisata. (2006). *Laporan Akhir: Penelitian Pengembangan Wisata Religi*. Departmen Kebudayaan dan Parawisata.
- Ramstedt, M. (1999). Muslim-Hindu Relations in Contemporary Indonesia. *ISIM Newsletter*, 4, 1.
- Slama, M. (2012). Wisata Religi – Religiöser Tourismus: Spirituelle Ökonomien und islamische Machtkämpfe in Indonesien. *ASIEN* 123, 77–94.
- Sobocinska, A. (2011). Innocence lost and paradise regained Tourism to Bali and Australian perceptions of Asia. *History Australia*, 8(2), 199–222. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14490854.2011.11668380>
- Stauth, G., & Schielke, S. (2008). *Dimensions of Locality: Muslim Saints, Their Place and Space*. Transcript.
- Stevens, G. (2013). Coping Support Factors Among Australians Affected by Terrorism: 2002 Bali Bombing Survivors Speak. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 199(11), 772–775. <https://doi.org/10.5694/mja13.10540>
- Stevens, G. J., Dunsmore, J. C., Agho, K. E., Taylor, M. R., Jones, A. L., Ritten, J. J. V., & Raphael, B. (2013). Long-term health and wellbeing of people affected by the 2002 Bali bombing. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 198(5), 273–277. <https://doi.org/10.5694/mja12.11480>
- Suryani, L. (2009). Suicide in paradise: Aftermath of the Bali bombings. *Psychological Medicine*, 39(8), 1317–1323. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0033291708004893>
- Thimm, V. (2018). Embodying and consuming modernity on Muslim pilgrimage: Gendered shopping and clothing practices by Malaysian women on “umrah and ziarah Dubai.” *Asian Anthropology*, 17(3), 185–203. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1683478X.2018.1483477>
- Tohari, A., & Raya, M. K. F. (2021). The Meaning of Religious Moderation on the Resilience of Muslim Minority in Balinese Hindus. *Journal of Contemporary Islam and Muslim Societies*, 5(1), 77–103. <https://doi.org/10.30821/jcims.v5i1.8686>
- Widjaja, Y. I. (2020). The effect of Islamic attributes and destination affective image on the reputation of the Halal tourism destination of Jakarta. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 11(2), 299–313. [https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v11.2\(42\).08](https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v11.2(42).08)