

## KORESPONDENSI PUBLIKASI

**Judul Artikel: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia**

**Penulis Pertama dan Korespondensi:**

**Imam Mahdi** (Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno, Indonesia; Email: [imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id](mailto:imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id)).

**Penulis Anggota:**

**Juhriyansyah Dalle** (Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia; Email: [j.dalle@ulm.ac.id](mailto:j.dalle@ulm.ac.id))

## Histori Publikasi

- Pendaftaran akun ke jurnal: 3 Januari 2021: [IJCC] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink
- Submit Paper: 7 Januari 2021; [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
- Keputusan Editor: 9 Januari 2021; [IJCC] Editor Decision
- Keputusan Editor: 2 April 2021: [IJCC] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 24 April 2021: [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 4 May 2021: [IJCC] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 11 May 2021: [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 26 May 2021: [IJCC] Editor Decision



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Sun, Jan 3, 2021 at 8:22 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

This mail is to let you know that your account (Signin ID: [imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id](mailto:imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id)) was created at the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

[NOTE] Before starting to use ManuscriptLink service, you need to confirm your email address (signin ID) by clicking the link below:

<https://www.manuscriptlink.com/user/confirm/eade0c8c71b346399d5490530df7b777>

Through the following link, you can access the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

\* Online System

URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc?id=imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

In the ManuscriptLink online system,

- \* If you are an author of manuscript, you can submit a manuscript and keep a close watch over the on-going review process including the review history of past manuscripts.
- \* If you are a manager of a journal, you can create and manage a new journal submission and review service, and customize your service according to the demand of editorial members.
- \* If you are an editorial member of a journal, you can manage a review process for a submitted manuscript and enhance the academic value of the journal by accepting or rejecting publication of submitted manuscripts.
- \* If you are a reviewer of a journal, you can evaluate a submitted manuscript and send your review report to editorial members of the journal.

Best regards,

ManuscriptLink Support Team  
Email: [support@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:support@manuscriptlink.com)  
<https://www.manuscriptlink.com>

Terms of Service and Privacy Policy

Terms of Service : <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/termsOfService>

Privacy Policy: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/privacyPolicy>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail.



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

1 message

**IJCC** <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Thu, Jan 7, 2021 at 8:23 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia

Author(s): Imam Mahdi, Juhriyansyah Dalle

Corresponding Author: Imam Mahdi

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Jan-2021 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation e-mail including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

**IJCC** <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Fri, Jan 9, 2021 at 11:59 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia

Author(s): Imam Mahdi, Juhriyansyah Dalle

Corresponding Author: Imam Mahdi

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Jan-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-9-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Fri, Apr 2, 2021 at 10:44 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*, "Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief  
*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*  
Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail  
-----

Reviewer- A

### Decision: **Revision required**

While reviewing this interesting manuscript, I found that the authors have tried to address an important issue. Nonetheless, I still have some other concerns that should be further addressed to make the study more influential

1. The introduction part is not well written and arranged as per the objectives of the study. However, the information provided in the introduction part is not symmetric. It also lacks contextual detail in the beginning. As this study is conducted in the Indonesian context, hence it is very important to give a background of Indonesian cybercrimes from the start of the manuscript. Secondly, the citations provided by the authors are too old, taken from studies from 2005-2014. It's 2021, and there are too many studies published in prestigious journals regarding the study context.
2. The gap in the study is not properly identified. What is already known in the field? Why is there a need to conduct a review study? There are many long sentences that are hard to understand. It is good to break such sentences into two or three sentences.
3. It is good to add a section-wise division of the paper by providing detail about each section.
4. A Research Conceptual Framework in the discussion can better explain the whole process and study purpose

5. The authors have well presented the details about the linkage of intellectual property laws. However, it would be good to articulate these with cyber security laws to make them more readable and influential.
  6. It is encouraged that authors add details about laws and regulations for the measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia
  7. Revise the conclusion to make it more influential and robust with key findings and implications rather than just providing the research summary.
  8. Check the references are written in APA 7 format. Also, cross-check that all the citations are present in the bibliography and vice versa
- 

Reviewer -B

Decision: Major revisions required

The topic of the paper is hot and interesting. I've read your article with a lot of interest. Overall, this paper has some practical innovations and also discusses the findings. Based on this reading, I'll start by providing some recommendations for improving the article:

- Firstly, the authors need to explain the terms cyber criminals, cyber criminology and phishing in detail. Also, there is a need to articulate the arguments in the introduction to section to place them in a coherent and systematic rate and clearly understand the problem statement and objectives of the study.
- Secondly, it would be very informative to add detailed information regarding constitutional laws in Indonesia. And presents an overview of the awareness of the community regarding cybercrimes. Also, there is a need to elaborate more on the role of cyber police in providing cyber security against cybercriminals.
- Thirdly, there is a need to add a conceptual research framework in the method section for a better understanding of the readers and make the study more powerful in the area.
- Fourth, the authors need to thoroughly discuss and elaborate on the implementation of measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia in the forms of laws and regulations
- Fifth, the conclusion needs revision based on the implications and significance of the study while presenting a brief description of the study
- Finally, several grammatical mistakes in the please manuscript make it hard to understand. Therefore, it is recommended for authors to thoroughly read the whole manuscript, and it is better to avail the services of native English speakers to make the write-up clearer and easy to understand

---

International Journal of Cyber Criminology

<http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Sat, Apr 24, 2021 at 11:33 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia

Author(s): Imam Mahdi, Juhriyansyah Dalle

Corresponding Author: Imam Mahdi

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Jan-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-9-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process and **we include your response to reviewer at the end of the email as our note**. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewer-A		
No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	While reviewing this interesting manuscript, I found that the authors have tried to address an important issue. Nonetheless, I still have some other concerns that should be further addressed to make the study more influential	Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind remarks and for providing us with the opportunity to revise our manuscript. We are very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments. These helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	The introduction part is not well written and arranged as per the objectives of the study. However, the information provided in the introduction part is not symmetric. It also lacks contextual detail in the beginning. As this study is conducted in the Indonesian context, hence it is very important to give a	Dear reviewer, we have revised the introduction by adding contextual information, i.e., in our study case Indonesian context, with a clear gap per your kind comments and suggestion.  We have also updated the citations, mostly from 2019 nineteen to 2022

	background of Indonesian cybercrimes from the start of the manuscript. Secondly, the citations provided by the authors are too old, taken from studies from 2005-2014. It's 2021, and there are too many studies published in prestigious journals regarding the study context.	Please see pages 1-4
2.	The gap in the study is not properly identified. What is already known in the field? Why is there a need to conduct a review study? There are many long sentences that are hard to understand. It is good to break such sentences into two or three sentences.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion. Following your kind instructions, we have revised the gap and also have breakdown the long sentences into smaller ones which are now easy to understand by the readers Please see pages 1-4
3	It is good to add a section-wise decision to the paper by providing detail about each section.	Respected reviewer, Thank you  We have now separately added the section-wise division of the paper by providing detail about each section.  please see pages number 3-4
4	A Research Conceptual Framework in the discussion can better explain the whole process and study purpose	Respected reviewer, Thank you  We have now added a conceptual research framework as per your kind guidelines and suggestions  please see pages number 7
5	The authors have well presented the details about the linkage of intellectual property laws. However, it would be good to articulate these with cyber security laws to make them more readable and influential.	Respected reviewer, many thanks for your appreciation for presenting our work. Following your kind guidelines, we have linked intellectual property laws with cyber security laws to make them more readable and influential. Please see page 6
6	It is encouraged that authors add details about laws and regulations for the measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia	Dear reviewer, we are really grateful for this kind suggestion to enhance the quality of our manuscript. Following your kind guidelines, we have added details about laws and regulations for the measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia Please see page no. 8
	Revise the conclusion to make it more influential and robust with key findings and implications rather than just providing the research summary.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion. We have revised the conclusion section per your kind guidelines by focusing on findings and implications and providing a brief research summary.  Please see pages 9-10
	Check the references are written in APA 7 format. Also, cross-check that all the citations are present in the bibliography and vice versa	Respected reviewer, Thank you  We have followed the journal guidelines for the references and cross-checked all the references as per your kind advise



<b>Response to Reviewer-B</b>		
<b>No.</b>	<b>Reviewer's Comment</b>	<b>Response</b>
	The topic of the paper is hot and interesting. I've read your article with a lot of interest. Overall, this paper has some practical innovations and also discusses the findings. Based on this reading, I'll start by providing some recommendations for improving the article	Thanks a lot, dear reviewer, for providing us with the opportunity to revise our manuscript. We are very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments. These helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	Firstly, the authors need to explain the terms cyber criminals, cyber criminology and phishing in detail. Also, there is a need to articulate the arguments in the introduction to section to place them in a coherent and systematic rate and clearly understand the problem statement and objectives of the study.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind remarks. We have devised almost all parts of the paper as per the valuable comments provided by your kind self regarding contribution and, most importantly, focusing on the practical contribution of the paper in contextual settings.  I hope your self will enjoy reading this version of the paper. Moreover, a detailed response to all the comments has been given as follows.  Please see pages 1-4
2.	Secondly, it would be very informative to add detailed information regarding constitutional laws in Indonesia. And presents an overview of the awareness of the community regarding cyber crimes. Also, there is a need to elaborate more on the role of cyber police in providing cyber security against cybercriminals.	Respected reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions and guidelines. We have now added detailed information regarding constitutional laws in Indonesia. And presented an overview of the awareness of the community regarding cyber crimes and elaborated more on the role of cyber police in providing cyber security against cybercriminals.  please see pages 5-7
3	Thirdly, there is a need to add a conceptual research framework in the method section for a better understanding of the readers and make the study more powerful in the area.	Respected reviewer, Thank you We have also added a conceptual research framework as per your kind guidelines and suggestions please see pages number 7
4	Fourth, the authors need to thoroughly discuss and elaborate on the implementation of measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia in the forms of laws and regulations	Dear reviewer, we are grateful for this kind suggestion to enhance the quality of our manuscript. Following your kind guidelines, we have now thoroughly discussed and elaborated on the implementation of measures taken in the context of cyber security available in Indonesia in the forms of laws and regulations  Please see pages 8-9
5	Fifth, the conclusion needs revision based on the implications and significance of the study while presenting a brief description of the study	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion. We have revised the conclusion section per your kind guidelines by focusing on findings and implications and providing a brief research summary.  Please see pages 9-10

6	Finally, several grammatical mistakes in the please manuscript make it hard to understand. Therefore, it is recommended for authors to thoroughly read the whole manuscript, and it is better to avail the services of native English speakers to make the write-up clearer and easy to understand	Dear reviewer, we are grateful for your observations and for helping us enhance our manuscript's quality with your kind suggestions, comments and guidelines. following your kind guidelines, we have now proof-edited art paper with the help of professional native English speakers to enhance its quality and readability
---	--	---



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

**IJCC** <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Tue, May 4, 2021 at 11:27 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*, " Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia ".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.

Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief  
*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*  
Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>



**IJCC-9-2021\_review.docx**  
235K

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail  
-----



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Tue, May 11, 2021 at 11:42 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia

Author(s): Imam Mahdi, Juhriyansyah Dalle

Corresponding Author: Imam Mahdi

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Jan-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-9-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Imam Mahdi <imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id>

## [IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>  
To: imam.mahdi@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Wed, May 26, 2021 at 11:23 AM

Dear Dr. Imam Mahdi,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Examining the Adequacy of Constitutional Laws Related to Cybercrimes in Indonesia

Author(s): Imam Mahdi, Juhriyansyah Dalle

Corresponding Author: Imam Mahdi

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Negeri Fatmawati Sukarno

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Jan-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-9-2021

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Cyber Criminology* (Vol. 15 No. 1, 2021). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Cyber Criminology*

Homepage: <http://www.cybercrimejournal.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.